

PULP-I-14  
Page 1 of 1  
Witness: Meini

NATIONAL FUEL GAS DISTRIBUTION CORPORATION  
NEW YORK DIVISION  
RESPONSE TO PUBLIC UTILITY LAW PROJECT  
REQUEST FOR INFORMATION  
CASE 16-G-0257

Question

Please provide a copy of any analysis prepared by the Company within the last year comparing charges of ESCOs with charges for default gas service, for both residential and non-residential customers.

Response

See PULP-14 Attachment 1 (Redacted).

**PUBLIC  
REDACTED  
VERSION**



	Note 1	Residential					Low Income Residential					Non-Residential					Total				
		TME	Usage (ccf)	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Percent	Usage (ccf)	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Percent	Usage (ccf)	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Percent	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference
NYD only	Aug 2015	67,450,867	\$56,141,487	\$67,316,378	\$11,174,891	19.9%	11,536,881	\$10,230,591	\$12,021,440	\$1,790,849	17.5%	42,586,437	\$31,544,787	\$35,210,446	\$3,665,659	11.6%	121,574,185	\$97,916,864	\$114,548,264	\$16,631,400	17.0%
NYD only	Sep 2015	66,506,266	\$55,208,147	\$66,260,790	\$11,052,643	20.0%	11,092,213	\$9,868,992	\$11,592,130	\$1,723,137	17.5%	42,196,710	\$31,043,054	\$34,758,050	\$3,714,995	12.0%	119,795,189	\$96,120,194	\$112,610,970	\$16,490,776	17.2%
NYD only	Oct 2015	66,165,962	\$54,627,275	\$65,664,135	\$11,036,860	20.2%	10,871,406	\$9,653,400	\$11,359,069	\$1,705,669	17.7%	42,033,229	\$30,667,078	\$34,466,225	\$3,799,146	12.4%	119,070,597	\$94,947,754	\$111,489,428	\$16,541,675	17.4%
NYD only	Nov 2015	65,503,179	\$53,396,027	\$64,508,019	\$11,111,992	20.8%	10,744,671	\$9,438,256	\$11,182,866	\$1,744,610	18.5%	41,587,857	\$29,888,498	\$33,789,105	\$3,900,607	13.1%	117,835,707	\$92,722,781	\$109,479,990	\$16,757,209	18.1%
NYD only	Dec 2015	64,399,252	\$50,801,070	\$62,517,960	\$11,716,890	23.1%	10,659,487	\$9,075,799	\$11,006,522	\$1,930,724	21.3%	40,420,801	\$28,072,800	\$32,304,303	\$4,231,503	15.1%	115,479,540	\$87,949,669	\$105,828,786	\$17,879,117	20.3%
NYD only	Jan 2016	62,010,623	\$46,818,875	\$59,424,834	\$12,605,959	26.9%	13,071,513	\$10,221,581	\$12,579,138	\$2,357,557	23.1%	39,634,128	\$26,175,588	\$31,025,236	\$4,849,648	18.5%	114,716,264	\$83,216,045	\$103,029,208	\$19,813,163	23.8%
NYD only	Feb 2016	59,969,775	\$43,988,240	\$57,030,691	\$13,042,451	29.6%	13,991,349	\$10,341,747	\$12,911,720	\$2,569,972	24.9%	38,424,034	\$24,449,706	\$29,830,777	\$5,381,070	22.0%	112,385,158	\$78,779,693	\$99,773,187	\$20,993,494	26.6%
NYD only	Mar 2016	58,029,672	\$41,656,457	\$54,849,054	\$13,192,597	31.7%	14,652,465	\$10,394,431	\$13,057,432	\$2,663,001	25.6%	37,094,212	\$22,861,673	\$28,482,018	\$5,620,345	24.6%	109,776,349	\$74,912,561	\$96,388,505	\$21,475,944	28.7%
<b>NYD only</b>	<b>Apr 2016</b>	<b>58,168,757</b>	<b>\$40,887,822</b>	<b>\$54,084,290</b>	<b>\$13,196,468</b>	<b>32.3%</b>	<b>15,276,524</b>	<b>\$10,546,315</b>	<b>\$13,184,098</b>	<b>\$2,637,783</b>	<b>25.0%</b>	<b>36,597,727</b>	<b>\$21,903,846</b>	<b>\$27,419,850</b>	<b>\$5,516,004</b>	<b>25.2%</b>	<b>110,043,008</b>	<b>\$73,337,983</b>	<b>\$94,688,238</b>	<b>\$21,350,255</b>	<b>29.1%</b>

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME April 2016

Marketer	NYD Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	23,510.00	17,498.79	35,097.55	17,598.76	26.08	100.6%	23,510	0.04%	\$17,499	\$35,098	26	\$17,599	100.6%	0.04%
2	14,594.00	9,668.62	18,033.05	8,364.43	18.63	86.5%	38,104	0.07%	\$27,167	\$53,131	22	\$25,963	95.6%	0.07%
3	376,332.00	262,870.90	487,247.44	224,376.54	354.58	85.4%	414,436	0.71%	\$290,038	\$540,378	133	\$250,340	86.3%	0.71%
4	94,727.00	70,281.87	129,723.63	59,441.76	104.08	84.6%	509,163	0.88%	\$360,320	\$670,102	126	\$309,781	86.0%	0.88%
5	29,757.00	19,047.32	35,062.61	16,015.29	22.75	84.1%	538,920	0.93%	\$379,368	\$705,164	105	\$325,797	85.9%	0.93%
6	124,278.00	81,830.29	143,148.83	61,318.54	99.58	74.9%	663,198	1.14%	\$461,198	\$848,313	104	\$387,115	83.9%	1.14%
7	63,176.00	47,896.50	82,626.96	34,730.46	72.00	72.5%	726,374	1.25%	\$509,094	\$930,940	100	\$421,846	82.9%	1.25%
8	638,293.00	477,450.92	813,610.66	336,159.74	713.75	70.4%	1,364,667	2.35%	\$986,545	\$1,744,551	176	\$758,006	76.8%	2.35%
9	2,095,008.00	1,530,519.02	2,529,721.91	999,202.89	2,211.50	65.3%	3,459,675	5.95%	\$2,517,064	\$4,274,273	403	\$1,757,208	69.8%	5.95%
10	92,450.00	62,268.13	102,741.11	40,472.98	80.00	65.0%	3,552,125	6.11%	\$2,579,332	\$4,377,014	370	\$1,797,681	69.7%	6.11%
11	1,003,885.00	752,405.84	1,201,012.59	448,606.75	1,126.25	59.6%	4,556,010	7.83%	\$3,331,738	\$5,578,026	439	\$2,246,288	67.4%	7.83%
12	4,227.00	3,301.65	5,220.08	1,918.43	5.08	58.1%	4,560,237	7.84%	\$3,335,040	\$5,583,246	403	\$2,248,207	67.4%	7.84%
13	1,426,426.00	1,017,875.41	1,608,900.18	591,024.77	1,398.67	58.1%	5,986,663	10.29%	\$4,352,915	\$7,192,147	479	\$2,839,231	65.2%	10.29%
14	6,944,326.00	5,352,368.93	8,321,634.01	2,969,265.08	8,213.58	55.5%	12,930,989	22.23%	\$9,705,284	\$15,513,781	1,032	\$5,808,496	59.8%	22.23%
15	1,823,200.00	1,301,393.87	2,022,243.65	720,849.78	1,839.42	55.4%	14,754,189	25.36%	\$11,006,678	\$17,536,024	1,086	\$6,529,246	59.3%	25.36%
16	1,576,432.00	1,130,189.65	1,730,969.72	600,780.07	1,579.67	53.2%	16,330,621	28.07%	\$12,136,868	\$19,266,994	1,117	\$7,130,126	58.7%	28.07%
17	2,600,026.00	1,778,082.44	2,680,951.34	902,868.90	2,342.17	50.8%	18,930,647	32.54%	\$13,914,950	\$21,947,945	1,189	\$8,032,995	57.7%	32.54%
18	766,360.00	494,782.93	739,188.99	244,406.06	610.25	49.4%	19,697,007	33.86%	\$14,409,733	\$22,687,134	1,157	\$8,277,401	57.4%	33.86%
19	3,121,681.00	2,369,684.92	3,529,892.53	1,160,207.61	3,561.50	49.0%	22,818,688	39.23%	\$16,779,418	\$26,217,027	1,283	\$9,437,609	56.2%	39.23%
20	185,780.00	131,773.99	193,705.94	61,931.95	182.92	47.0%	23,004,468	39.55%	\$16,911,192	\$26,410,733	1,228	\$9,499,541	56.2%	39.55%
21	148,119.00	111,119.75	163,317.31	52,197.56	167.00	47.0%	23,152,587	39.80%	\$17,022,312	\$26,574,050	1,178	\$9,551,738	56.1%	39.80%
22	453,075.00	318,159.94	436,319.66	118,159.72	426.83	37.1%	23,605,662	40.58%	\$17,340,472	\$27,010,370	1,143	\$9,669,898	55.8%	40.58%
23	341,286.00	248,985.33	332,415.95	83,430.62	357.75	33.5%	23,946,948	41.17%	\$17,589,457	\$27,342,786	1,109	\$9,753,329	55.4%	41.17%
24	539.00	323.91	432.44	108.53	2.00	33.5%	23,947,487	41.17%	\$17,589,781	\$27,343,218	1,063	\$9,753,437	55.4%	41.17%
25	1,457,503.00	1,076,767.06	1,433,901.30	357,134.24	1,536.17	33.2%	25,404,990	43.67%	\$18,666,548	\$28,777,119	1,082	\$10,110,571	54.2%	43.67%
26	18,521.00	12,990.29	16,982.52	3,992.23	17.92	30.7%	25,423,511	43.71%	\$18,679,538	\$28,794,102	1,041	\$10,114,564	54.1%	43.71%
27	687,326.00	426,369.64	526,128.49	99,758.85	472.67	23.4%	26,110,837	44.89%	\$19,105,908	\$29,320,230	1,020	\$10,214,323	53.5%	44.89%
28	4,899,763.00	3,603,456.47	4,392,335.21	788,878.74	5,180.08	21.9%	31,010,600	53.31%	\$22,709,364	\$33,712,566	1,169	\$11,003,201	48.5%	53.31%
29	171,266.00	119,332.93	145,514.77	26,181.84	161.42	21.9%	31,181,866	53.61%	\$22,828,697	\$33,858,080	1,134	\$11,029,383	48.3%	53.61%
30	106,683.00	84,886.32	102,319.24	17,432.92	136.58	20.5%	31,288,549	53.79%	\$22,913,584	\$33,960,400	1,101	\$11,046,816	48.2%	53.79%
31	194,209.00	125,720.70	150,990.24	25,269.54	153.83	20.1%	31,482,758	54.12%	\$23,039,304	\$34,111,390	1,070	\$11,072,086	48.1%	54.12%
32	11,152,261.00	7,992,031.66	9,515,921.51	1,523,889.85	11,378.83	19.1%	42,635,019	73.30%	\$31,031,336	\$43,627,311	1,392	\$12,595,975	40.6%	73.30%
33	189,503.00	86,159.67	98,980.39	12,820.72	42.50	14.9%	42,824,522	73.62%	\$31,117,496	\$43,726,292	1,351	\$12,608,796	40.5%	73.62%
34	2,039,622.00	1,347,870.06	1,508,337.04	160,466.98	1,692.08	11.9%	44,864,144	77.13%	\$32,465,366	\$45,234,629	1,361	\$12,769,263	39.3%	77.13%
35	13,558.00	7,682.80	8,329.27	646.47	8.00	8.4%	44,877,702	77.15%	\$32,473,049	\$45,242,958	1,323	\$12,769,910	39.3%	77.15%
36	7,108,559.00	5,017,753.33	5,410,629.36	392,876.03	6,861.75	7.8%	51,986,261	89.37%	\$37,490,802	\$50,653,587	1,477	\$13,162,786	35.1%	89.37%
37	502,169.00	355,169.09	381,904.21	26,735.12	484.17	7.5%	52,488,430	90.23%	\$37,845,971	\$51,035,492	1,450	\$13,189,521	34.9%	90.23%
38	1,225,773.00	840,904.25	875,396.47	34,492.22	1,094.42	4.1%	53,714,203	92.34%	\$38,686,875	\$51,910,888	1,440	\$13,224,013	34.2%	92.34%
39	42,078.00	23,674.96	23,559.68	(115.28)	46.57	-0.5%	53,756,281	92.41%	\$38,710,550	\$51,934,448	1,405	\$13,223,898	34.2%	92.41%
40	50,110.00	28,041.60	27,796.89	(244.71)	46.38	-0.9%	53,806,391	92.50%	\$38,738,592	\$51,962,245	1,371	\$13,223,653	34.1%	92.50%
41	532,748.00	393,875.50	389,683.96	(4,191.54)	556.83	-1.1%	54,339,139	93.42%	\$39,132,467	\$52,351,929	1,351	\$13,219,461	33.8%	93.42%
42	3,561,618.00	1,610,390.69	1,589,259.31	(21,131.38)	817.50	-1.3%	57,900,757	99.54%	\$40,742,858	\$53,941,188	1,338	\$13,198,330	32.4%	99.54%
43	268,000.00	144,964.46	143,102.37	(1,862.09)	202.88	-1.3%	58,168,757	100.00%	\$40,887,822	\$54,084,290	1,312	\$13,196,468	32.3%	100.00%
Total	58,168,757	\$40,887,822.40	\$54,084,290.37	\$13,196,467.97	1,311.78	32.3%								

7.84% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 67.4% more than NFG costs

41.17% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 55.4% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME April 2016

Marketer	NYD Low Income Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Low Income Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	5,271.00	3,140.06	5,897.23	2,757.17	5.25	87.8%	5,271	0.03%	\$3,140	\$5,897	5	\$2,757	87.8%	0.03%
2	4,916.00	3,985.54	7,212.35	3,226.81	6.92	81.0%	10,187	0.07%	\$7,126	\$13,110	6	\$5,984	84.0%	0.07%
3	91,772.00	57,678.45	99,777.80	42,099.35	71.17	73.0%	101,959	0.67%	\$64,804	\$112,887	28	\$48,083	74.2%	0.67%
4	13,410.00	10,359.58	17,426.79	7,067.21	17.17	68.2%	115,369	0.76%	\$75,164	\$130,314	25	\$55,151	73.4%	0.76%
5	24,372.00	19,769.83	32,657.86	12,888.03	32.50	65.2%	139,741	0.91%	\$94,933	\$162,972	27	\$68,039	71.7%	0.91%
6	8,280.00	4,758.38	7,725.91	2,967.53	6.00	62.4%	148,021	0.97%	\$99,692	\$170,698	23	\$71,006	71.2%	0.97%
7	307,075.00	226,133.16	366,911.78	140,778.62	331.17	62.3%	455,096	2.98%	\$325,825	\$537,610	67	\$211,785	65.0%	2.98%
8	12,756.00	10,151.30	16,281.42	6,130.12	16.00	60.4%	467,852	3.06%	\$335,976	\$553,891	61	\$217,915	64.9%	3.06%
9	5,062.00	3,768.45	5,746.85	1,978.40	5.00	52.5%	472,914	3.10%	\$339,745	\$559,638	55	\$219,893	64.7%	3.10%
10	304,310.00	232,556.19	353,182.76	120,626.57	350.25	51.9%	777,224	5.09%	\$572,301	\$912,821	84	\$340,520	59.5%	5.09%
11	766,004.00	500,065.21	751,961.67	251,896.46	638.75	50.4%	1,543,228	10.10%	\$1,072,366	\$1,664,782	135	\$592,416	55.2%	10.10%
12	33,529.00	22,856.96	34,211.84	11,354.88	31.92	49.7%	1,576,757	10.32%	\$1,095,223	\$1,698,994	126	\$603,771	55.1%	10.32%
13	192,443.00	150,117.33	220,661.84	70,544.51	236.92	47.0%	1,769,200	11.58%	\$1,245,340	\$1,919,656	135	\$674,316	54.1%	11.58%
14	478,354.00	355,152.91	518,212.28	163,059.37	539.00	45.9%	2,247,554	14.71%	\$1,600,493	\$2,437,868	163	\$837,375	52.3%	14.71%
15	1,790,681.00	1,406,403.29	2,041,162.35	634,759.06	2,192.50	45.1%	4,038,235	26.43%	\$3,006,897	\$4,479,031	299	\$1,472,134	49.0%	26.43%
16	1,629,342.00	1,176,928.80	1,696,987.09	520,058.29	1,710.42	44.2%	5,667,577	37.10%	\$4,183,825	\$6,176,018	387	\$1,992,192	47.6%	37.10%
17	449,922.00	308,717.79	433,050.91	124,333.12	420.08	40.3%	6,117,499	40.05%	\$4,492,543	\$6,609,069	389	\$2,116,526	47.1%	40.05%
18	105,663.00	74,107.42	103,863.00	29,755.58	103.00	40.2%	6,223,162	40.74%	\$4,566,651	\$6,712,932	373	\$2,146,281	47.0%	40.74%
19	8,855.00	4,684.73	6,552.41	1,867.68	4.50	39.9%	6,232,017	40.79%	\$4,571,335	\$6,719,484	354	\$2,148,149	47.0%	40.79%
20	620,450.00	442,815.66	616,021.02	173,205.36	630.75	39.1%	6,852,467	44.86%	\$5,014,151	\$7,335,505	367	\$2,321,354	46.3%	44.86%
21	102,571.00	77,488.41	104,471.25	26,982.84	117.75	34.8%	6,955,038	45.53%	\$5,091,639	\$7,439,976	356	\$2,348,337	46.1%	45.53%
22	21,464.00	17,577.13	23,072.87	5,495.74	29.00	31.3%	6,976,502	45.67%	\$5,109,217	\$7,463,049	341	\$2,353,833	46.1%	45.67%
23	688,453.00	481,531.61	622,827.92	141,296.31	687.50	29.3%	7,664,955	50.17%	\$5,590,748	\$8,085,877	356	\$2,495,129	44.6%	50.17%
24	119,587.00	85,319.31	109,553.06	24,233.75	116.25	28.4%	7,784,542	50.96%	\$5,676,068	\$8,195,430	346	\$2,519,363	44.4%	50.96%
25	74,572.00	56,753.32	69,042.33	12,289.01	84.33	21.7%	7,859,114	51.45%	\$5,732,821	\$8,264,473	335	\$2,531,652	44.2%	51.45%
26	156,230.00	101,231.16	118,531.31	17,300.15	130.33	17.1%	8,015,344	52.47%	\$5,834,052	\$8,383,004	327	\$2,548,952	43.7%	52.47%
27	34,977.00	25,055.38	28,489.73	3,434.35	36.33	13.7%	8,050,321	52.70%	\$5,859,107	\$8,411,494	317	\$2,552,386	43.6%	52.70%
28	1,237,422.00	918,526.98	1,034,457.43	115,930.45	1,343.92	12.6%	9,287,743	60.80%	\$6,777,634	\$9,445,951	353	\$2,668,317	39.4%	60.80%
29	75,121.00	58,293.03	65,074.45	6,781.42	88.17	11.6%	9,362,864	61.29%	\$6,835,927	\$9,511,026	344	\$2,675,098	39.1%	61.29%
30	1,553,490.00	1,141,796.09	1,253,876.77	112,080.68	1,736.00	9.8%	10,916,354	71.46%	\$7,977,723	\$10,764,902	391	\$2,787,179	34.9%	71.46%
31	7,706.00	6,054.12	6,466.27	412.15	9.42	6.8%	10,924,060	71.51%	\$7,983,778	\$10,771,369	378	\$2,787,591	34.9%	71.51%
32	0.00	0.00	(0.00)	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,924,060	71.51%	\$7,983,778	\$10,771,369	367	\$2,787,591	34.9%	71.51%
33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,924,060	71.51%	\$7,983,778	\$10,771,369	355	\$2,787,591	34.9%	71.51%
34	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,924,060	71.51%	\$7,983,778	\$10,771,369	345	\$2,787,591	34.9%	71.51%
35	122,247.00	93,674.00	90,482.06	(3,191.94)	144.33	-3.4%	11,046,307	72.31%	\$8,077,452	\$10,861,851	339	\$2,784,399	34.5%	72.31%
36	600,887.00	468,035.11	447,560.93	(20,474.18)	727.83	-4.4%	11,647,194	76.24%	\$8,545,487	\$11,309,412	350	\$2,763,925	32.3%	76.24%
37	61,000.00	44,289.50	42,215.87	(2,073.63)	61.83	-4.7%	11,708,194	76.64%	\$8,589,776	\$11,351,627	342	\$2,761,851	32.2%	76.64%
38	2,636,893.00	1,404,599.59	1,322,839.67	(81,759.92)	1,686.35	-5.8%	14,345,087	93.90%	\$9,994,376	\$12,674,467	378	\$2,680,091	26.8%	93.90%
39	408,031.00	227,451.68	211,791.02	(15,660.66)	361.88	-6.9%	14,753,118	96.57%	\$10,221,827	\$12,886,258	377	\$2,664,431	26.1%	96.57%
40	64,084.00	49,233.54	45,789.41	(3,444.13)	74.50	-7.0%	14,817,202	96.99%	\$10,271,061	\$12,932,048	370	\$2,660,987	25.9%	96.99%
41	379,891.00	214,278.70	198,620.94	(15,657.76)	340.80	-7.3%	15,197,093	99.48%	\$10,485,340	\$13,130,668	369	\$2,645,329	25.2%	99.48%
42	35,144.00	27,137.91	24,096.28	(3,041.63)	41.00	-11.2%	15,232,237	99.71%	\$10,512,478	\$13,154,765	361	\$2,642,287	25.1%	99.71%
43	44,287.00	33,837.20	29,332.83	(4,504.37)	52.50	-13.3%	15,276,524	100.00%	\$10,546,315	\$13,184,098	354	\$2,637,783	25.0%	
Total	15,276,524	\$10,546,314.81	\$13,184,097.56	\$2,637,782.75	353.94	25.0%								

10.32% of Low Income residential NGS customer usage has paid 55.1% more than NFG costs

50.17% of Low Income residential NGS customer usage has paid 44.6% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME April 2016

Marketer	NYD Non-Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Non-Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	6,068.00	4,346.84	8,980.46	4,633.62	4.00	106.6%	6,068	0.02%	\$4,347	\$8,980	4	\$4,634	106.6%	0.02%
2	27,623.00	19,890.85	38,463.61	18,572.76	16.67	93.4%	33,691	0.09%	\$24,238	\$47,444	10	\$23,206	95.7%	0.09%
3	3,439.00	2,150.56	3,875.91	1,725.35	1.00	80.2%	37,130	0.10%	\$26,388	\$51,320	7	\$24,932	94.5%	0.10%
4	18,476.00	11,055.42	19,726.74	8,671.32	3.00	78.4%	55,606	0.15%	\$37,444	\$71,047	6	\$33,603	89.7%	0.15%
5	745,684.00	400,279.93	707,005.94	306,726.01	20.00	76.6%	801,290	2.19%	\$437,724	\$778,053	9	\$340,329	77.7%	2.19%
6	3,077.00	2,498.02	4,143.64	1,645.62	3.00	65.9%	804,367	2.20%	\$440,222	\$782,196	8	\$341,975	77.7%	2.20%
7	31,537.00	22,406.83	37,065.69	14,658.86	20.00	65.4%	835,904	2.28%	\$462,628	\$819,262	10	\$356,634	77.1%	2.28%
8	325,397.00	224,809.94	367,895.06	143,085.12	158.25	63.6%	1,161,301	3.17%	\$687,438	\$1,187,157	28	\$499,719	72.7%	3.17%
9	919,294.00	518,047.19	845,730.91	327,683.72	96.75	63.3%	2,080,595	5.69%	\$1,205,486	\$2,032,888	36	\$827,402	68.6%	5.69%
10	239,585.00	148,496.94	237,786.93	89,289.99	68.33	60.1%	2,320,180	6.34%	\$1,353,983	\$2,270,675	39	\$916,692	67.7%	6.34%
11	17,057.00	11,359.87	17,469.72	6,109.85	6.00	53.8%	2,337,237	6.39%	\$1,365,342	\$2,288,145	36	\$922,802	67.6%	6.39%
12	6,786.00	4,302.29	6,555.26	2,252.97	2.00	52.4%	2,344,023	6.40%	\$1,369,645	\$2,294,700	33	\$925,055	67.5%	6.40%
13	44,559.00	29,935.30	44,532.77	14,597.47	19.25	48.8%	2,388,582	6.53%	\$1,399,580	\$2,339,233	32	\$939,653	67.1%	6.53%
14	1,188,062.00	789,603.59	1,169,516.13	379,912.54	538.25	48.1%	3,576,644	9.77%	\$2,189,184	\$3,508,749	68	\$1,319,565	60.3%	9.77%
15	1,310,225.00	846,388.76	1,240,055.42	393,666.66	518.92	46.5%	4,886,869	13.35%	\$3,035,572	\$4,748,804	98	\$1,713,232	56.4%	13.35%
16	136,762.00	74,148.15	106,339.78	32,191.63	3.00	43.4%	5,023,631	13.73%	\$3,109,720	\$4,855,144	92	\$1,745,423	56.1%	13.73%
17	661,546.00	452,786.37	641,488.96	188,702.59	340.25	41.7%	5,685,177	15.53%	\$3,562,507	\$5,496,633	107	\$1,934,126	54.3%	15.53%
18	22,710.00	14,090.70	19,578.16	5,487.46	6.75	38.9%	5,707,887	15.60%	\$3,576,598	\$5,516,211	101	\$1,939,614	54.2%	15.60%
19	457,729.00	307,600.54	426,325.89	118,725.35	230.42	38.6%	6,165,616	16.85%	\$3,884,198	\$5,942,537	108	\$2,058,339	53.0%	16.85%
20	107,907.00	70,369.47	95,980.83	25,611.36	39.92	36.4%	6,273,523	17.14%	\$3,954,568	\$6,038,518	105	\$2,083,950	52.7%	17.14%
21	2,742.00	2,018.06	2,643.42	625.36	2.00	31.0%	6,276,265	17.15%	\$3,956,586	\$6,041,161	100	\$2,084,576	52.7%	17.15%
22	804.00	533.20	692.38	159.18	2.50	29.9%	6,277,069	17.15%	\$3,957,119	\$6,041,854	95	\$2,084,735	52.7%	17.15%
23	9,765.00	7,040.64	9,015.29	1,974.65	5.42	28.0%	6,286,834	17.18%	\$3,964,159	\$6,050,869	92	\$2,086,709	52.6%	17.18%
24	351,438.00	248,226.51	312,581.88	64,355.37	204.67	25.9%	6,638,272	18.14%	\$4,212,386	\$6,363,451	96	\$2,151,065	51.1%	18.14%
25	908,337.00	559,028.88	704,076.05	145,047.17	224.33	25.9%	7,546,609	20.62%	\$4,771,415	\$7,067,527	101	\$2,296,112	48.1%	20.62%
26	11,300,651.00	6,426,472.69	7,884,364.37	1,457,891.68	1,407.67	22.7%	18,847,260	51.50%	\$11,197,888	\$14,951,891	152	\$3,754,004	33.5%	51.50%
27	788.00	572.57	700.62	128.05	1.00	22.4%	18,848,048	51.50%	\$11,198,460	\$14,952,592	146	\$3,754,132	33.5%	51.50%
28	895,411.00	528,541.62	646,375.46	117,833.84	159.42	22.3%	19,743,459	53.95%	\$11,727,002	\$15,598,967	147	\$3,871,966	33.0%	53.95%
29	3,752,433.00	2,218,502.17	2,712,612.57	494,110.40	683.25	22.3%	23,495,892	64.20%	\$13,945,504	\$18,311,580	165	\$4,366,076	31.3%	64.20%
30	6,735,508.00	3,954,735.09	4,727,670.53	772,935.44	1,159.42	19.5%	30,231,400	82.60%	\$17,900,239	\$23,039,250	198	\$5,139,011	28.7%	82.60%
31	1,845,986.00	1,142,058.68	1,352,676.32	210,617.64	425.42	18.4%	32,077,386	87.65%	\$19,042,298	\$24,391,927	206	\$5,349,629	28.1%	87.65%
32	392,515.00	238,787.74	270,740.09	31,952.35	82.42	13.4%	32,469,901	88.72%	\$19,281,085	\$24,662,667	202	\$5,381,581	27.9%	88.72%
33	401,294.00	230,672.30	251,658.68	20,986.38	43.58	9.1%	32,871,195	89.82%	\$19,511,758	\$24,914,325	197	\$5,402,568	27.7%	89.82%
34	1,265,817.00	756,572.03	824,637.52	68,065.49	258.42	9.0%	34,137,012	93.28%	\$20,268,330	\$25,738,963	199	\$5,470,633	27.0%	93.28%
35	38,347.00	21,792.64	23,507.77	1,715.13	8.00	7.9%	34,175,359	93.38%	\$20,290,122	\$25,762,471	193	\$5,472,348	27.0%	93.38%
36	83,029.00	50,054.76	51,873.08	1,818.32	24.00	3.6%	34,258,388	93.61%	\$20,340,177	\$25,814,344	189	\$5,474,167	26.9%	93.61%
37	2,339,339.00	1,563,668.87	1,605,506.39	41,837.52	1,048.58	2.7%								
Total	36,597,727	\$21,903,846.01	\$27,419,850.23	\$5,516,004.22	212	25.2%								

6.4% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid more than NFG costs

17.15% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME March 2016

Marketer	NYD Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	23,989.00	18,347.58	35,752.78	17,405.20	26.92	94.9%	23,989	0.04%	\$18,348	\$35,753	27	\$17,405	94.9%	0.04%
2	12,355.00	8,246.34	15,311.32	7,064.98	18.29	85.7%	36,344	0.06%	\$26,594	\$51,064	23	\$24,470	92.0%	0.06%
3	105,821.00	76,297.29	140,414.77	64,117.48	105.50	84.0%	142,165	0.24%	\$102,891	\$191,479	50	\$88,588	86.1%	0.24%
4	363,339.00	259,325.78	475,299.83	215,974.05	347.50	83.3%	505,504	0.87%	\$362,217	\$666,779	125	\$304,562	84.1%	0.87%
5	26,081.00	16,613.42	29,580.59	12,967.17	19.67	78.1%	531,585	0.92%	\$378,830	\$696,359	104	\$317,529	83.8%	0.92%
6	110,488.00	73,136.51	127,523.06	54,386.55	89.42	74.4%	642,073	1.11%	\$451,967	\$823,882	101	\$371,915	82.3%	1.11%
7	661,149.00	502,653.53	849,472.74	346,819.21	728.75	69.0%	1,303,222	2.25%	\$954,620	\$1,673,355	191	\$718,735	75.3%	2.25%
8	65,382.00	50,368.03	85,121.38	34,753.35	73.00	69.0%	1,368,604	2.36%	\$1,004,988	\$1,758,476	176	\$753,488	75.0%	2.36%
9	91,131.00	63,003.40	103,156.57	40,153.17	81.08	63.7%	1,459,735	2.52%	\$1,067,992	\$1,861,633	166	\$793,641	74.3%	2.52%
10	2,153,680.00	1,605,001.60	2,614,082.41	1,009,080.81	2,260.17	62.9%	3,613,415	6.23%	\$2,672,993	\$4,475,715	375	\$1,802,722	67.4%	6.23%
11	1,017,772.00	778,136.92	1,228,553.63	450,416.71	1,139.25	57.9%	4,631,187	7.98%	\$3,451,130	\$5,704,269	445	\$2,253,139	65.3%	7.98%
12	1,395,445.00	1,016,645.23	1,591,237.25	574,592.02	1,380.75	56.5%	6,026,632	10.39%	\$4,467,776	\$7,295,506	523	\$2,827,731	63.3%	10.39%
13	4,148.00	3,304.56	5,140.13	1,835.57	5.00	55.5%	6,030,780	10.39%	\$4,471,080	\$7,300,646	483	\$2,829,566	63.3%	10.39%
14	7,043,055.00	5,529,355.37	8,556,865.56	3,027,510.19	8,289.42	54.8%	13,073,835	22.53%	\$10,000,436	\$15,857,512	1,040	\$5,857,076	58.6%	22.53%
15	1,811,372.00	1,320,808.10	2,028,459.87	707,651.77	1,834.17	53.6%	14,885,207	25.65%	\$11,321,244	\$17,885,972	1,093	\$6,564,728	58.0%	25.65%
16	1,543,579.00	1,130,789.74	1,725,413.83	594,624.09	1,556.17	52.6%	16,428,786	28.31%	\$12,452,033	\$19,611,386	1,122	\$7,159,352	57.5%	28.31%
17	181,713.00	132,231.74	194,960.66	62,728.92	181.25	47.4%	16,610,499	28.62%	\$12,584,265	\$19,806,346	1,067	\$7,222,081	57.4%	28.62%
18	760,295.00	503,614.88	741,075.40	237,460.52	612.92	47.2%	17,370,794	29.93%	\$13,087,880	\$20,547,422	1,042	\$7,459,542	57.0%	29.93%
19	2,522,746.00	1,756,642.91	2,572,553.12	815,910.21	2,269.75	46.4%	19,893,540	34.28%	\$14,844,523	\$23,119,975	1,106	\$8,275,452	55.7%	34.28%
20	3,056,676.00	2,372,077.55	3,471,500.92	1,099,423.37	3,527.00	46.3%	22,950,216	39.55%	\$17,216,600	\$26,591,476	1,227	\$9,374,875	54.5%	39.55%
21	153,353.00	116,988.88	169,872.87	52,883.99	171.50	45.2%	23,103,569	39.81%	\$17,333,589	\$26,761,349	1,177	\$9,427,759	54.4%	39.81%
22	310.00	178.84	245.66	66.82	2.00	37.4%	23,103,879	39.81%	\$17,333,768	\$26,761,594	1,124	\$9,427,826	54.4%	39.81%
23	443,349.00	319,379.01	432,511.69	113,132.68	423.58	35.4%	23,547,228	40.58%	\$17,653,147	\$27,194,106	1,093	\$9,540,959	54.0%	40.58%
24	1,379,607.00	1,041,518.34	1,407,099.69	365,581.35	1,484.17	35.1%	24,926,835	42.96%	\$18,694,666	\$28,601,206	1,109	\$9,906,540	53.0%	42.96%
25	347,951.00	258,725.74	342,337.07	83,611.33	363.08	32.3%	25,274,786	43.55%	\$18,953,391	\$28,943,543	1,080	\$9,990,152	52.7%	43.55%
26	15,354.00	11,031.21	14,449.78	3,418.57	15.50	31.0%	25,290,140	43.58%	\$18,964,423	\$28,957,993	1,039	\$9,993,570	52.7%	43.58%
27	162,191.00	114,864.67	140,352.34	25,487.67	154.00	22.2%	25,452,331	43.86%	\$19,079,287	\$29,098,345	1,006	\$10,019,058	52.5%	43.86%
28	684,494.00	434,003.68	530,100.06	96,096.38	467.83	22.1%	26,136,825	45.04%	\$19,513,291	\$29,628,445	987	\$10,115,154	51.8%	45.04%
29	4,935,916.00	3,704,973.13	4,511,147.76	806,174.63	5,201.75	21.8%	31,072,741	53.55%	\$23,218,264	\$34,139,593	1,132	\$10,921,329	47.0%	53.55%
30	112,903.00	90,763.65	109,582.82	18,819.17	141.25	20.7%	31,185,644	53.74%	\$23,309,028	\$34,249,176	1,099	\$10,940,148	46.9%	53.74%
31	11,149,650.00	8,144,113.61	9,759,809.57	1,615,695.96	11,398.83	19.8%	42,335,294	72.95%	\$31,453,141	\$44,008,985	1,431	\$12,555,844	39.9%	72.95%
32	191,751.00	126,282.59	150,433.68	24,151.09	150.67	19.1%	42,527,045	73.28%	\$31,579,424	\$44,159,419	1,391	\$12,579,995	39.8%	73.28%
33	193,461.00	91,367.03	105,310.50	13,943.47	44.17	15.3%	42,720,506	73.62%	\$31,670,791	\$44,264,729	1,350	\$12,593,938	39.8%	73.62%
34	2,054,146.00	1,387,998.27	1,565,623.49	177,625.22	1,702.08	12.8%	44,774,652	77.16%	\$33,058,789	\$45,830,353	1,361	\$12,771,564	38.6%	77.16%
35	13,560.00	7,880.58	8,494.38	613.80	8.00	7.8%	44,788,212	77.18%	\$33,066,670	\$45,838,847	1,322	\$12,772,177	38.6%	77.18%
36	7,118,936.00	5,130,849.37	5,516,043.93	385,194.56	6,863.08	7.5%	51,907,148	89.45%	\$38,197,519	\$51,354,891	1,476	\$13,157,372	34.4%	89.45%
37	500,151.00	361,264.57	386,685.16	25,420.59	481.83	7.0%	52,407,299	90.31%	\$38,558,784	\$51,741,576	1,449	\$13,182,793	34.2%	90.31%
38	1,229,160.00	861,975.12	893,881.84	31,906.72	1,092.08	3.7%	53,636,459	92.43%	\$39,420,759	\$52,635,458	1,440	\$13,214,699	33.5%	92.43%
39	32,559.00	18,280.05	18,514.27	234.22	41.00	1.3%	53,669,018	92.49%	\$39,439,039	\$52,653,972	1,404	\$13,214,934	33.5%	92.49%
40	37,806.00	21,235.04	21,411.19	176.15	40.00	0.8%	53,706,824	92.55%	\$39,460,274	\$52,675,384	1,370	\$13,215,110	33.5%	92.55%
41	219,884.00	120,179.86	120,576.40	396.54	193.00	0.3%	53,926,708	92.93%	\$39,580,454	\$52,795,960	1,341	\$13,215,506	33.4%	92.93%
42	535,288.00	403,533.50	401,438.28	(2,095.22)	557.83	-0.5%	54,461,996	93.85%	\$39,983,987	\$53,197,398	1,322	\$13,213,411	33.0%	93.85%
43	3,567,676.00	1,672,469.75	1,651,656.10	(20,813.65)	814.25	-1.2%	58,029,672	100.00%	\$41,656,457	\$54,849,054	1,311	\$13,192,597	31.7%	100.00%
Total	58,029,672	\$41,656,456.97	\$54,849,054.35	\$13,192,597.38	1,310.64	31.7%								

10.39% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 63.3% more than NFG costs

40.58% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 54% more than NFG costs



National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME March 2016

Marketer	NYD Low Income Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Low Income Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	4,388.00	2,640.24	4,963.27	2,323.03	5.14	88.0%	4,388	0.03%	\$2,640	\$4,963	5	\$2,323	88.0%	0.03%
2	5,777.00	4,746.03	8,452.95	3,706.92	7.83	78.1%	10,165	0.07%	\$7,386	\$13,416	6	\$6,030	81.6%	0.07%
3	88,388.00	55,737.93	96,671.83	40,933.90	67.05	73.4%	98,553	0.67%	\$63,124	\$110,088	27	\$46,964	74.4%	0.67%
4	13,581.00	10,521.48	17,884.31	7,362.83	16.92	70.0%	112,134	0.77%	\$73,646	\$127,972	24	\$54,327	73.8%	0.77%
5	316,430.00	237,181.32	384,313.41	147,132.09	338.50	62.0%	428,564	2.92%	\$310,827	\$512,286	87	\$201,459	64.8%	2.92%
6	23,602.00	19,815.06	31,942.81	12,127.75	32.33	61.2%	452,166	3.09%	\$330,642	\$544,229	78	\$213,587	64.6%	3.09%
7	13,558.00	10,701.81	17,101.66	6,399.85	16.00	59.8%	465,724	3.18%	\$341,344	\$561,330	69	\$219,986	64.4%	3.18%
8	6,389.00	3,707.42	5,830.15	2,122.73	4.58	57.3%	472,113	3.22%	\$345,051	\$567,160	61	\$222,109	64.4%	3.22%
9	5,501.00	4,153.32	6,250.34	2,097.02	5.42	50.5%	477,614	3.26%	\$349,205	\$573,411	55	\$224,206	64.2%	3.26%
10	314,835.00	244,882.05	367,470.03	122,587.98	358.58	50.1%	792,449	5.41%	\$594,087	\$940,881	85	\$346,794	58.4%	5.41%
11	30,472.00	21,364.22	31,950.38	10,586.16	30.08	49.6%	822,921	5.62%	\$615,451	\$972,831	80	\$357,380	58.1%	5.62%
12	713,685.00	477,420.32	710,968.49	233,548.17	610.17	48.9%	1,536,606	10.49%	\$1,092,871	\$1,683,800	124	\$590,928	54.1%	10.49%
13	202,923.00	160,677.02	234,757.09	74,080.07	247.17	46.1%	1,739,529	11.87%	\$1,253,548	\$1,918,557	134	\$665,008	53.1%	11.87%
14	1,811,373.00	1,449,555.58	2,097,582.78	648,027.20	2,211.33	44.7%	3,550,902	24.23%	\$2,703,104	\$4,016,140	282	\$1,313,036	48.6%	24.23%
15	470,965.00	358,390.76	518,347.47	159,956.71	537.75	44.6%	4,021,867	27.45%	\$3,061,495	\$4,534,487	299	\$1,472,992	48.1%	27.45%
16	7,613.00	3,992.73	5,728.82	1,736.09	3.67	43.5%	4,029,480	27.50%	\$3,065,487	\$4,540,216	281	\$1,474,729	48.1%	27.50%
17	1,559,124.00	1,156,152.73	1,640,315.58	484,162.85	1,666.25	41.9%	5,588,604	38.14%	\$4,221,640	\$6,180,531	362	\$1,958,891	46.4%	38.14%
18	111,399.00	291,972.11	410,329.21	118,357.10	396.17	40.5%	6,000,003	40.95%	\$4,513,612	\$6,590,861	364	\$2,077,248	46.0%	40.95%
19	103,520.00	75,141.38	103,527.86	28,386.48	104.08	37.8%	6,103,523	41.66%	\$4,588,754	\$6,694,388	350	\$2,105,635	45.9%	41.66%
20	104,786.00	80,773.84	109,751.78	28,977.94	120.08	35.9%	6,208,309	42.37%	\$4,669,527	\$6,804,140	339	\$2,134,613	45.7%	42.37%
21	604,724.00	441,211.67	597,356.81	156,145.14	616.75	35.4%	6,813,033	46.50%	\$5,110,739	\$7,401,497	352	\$2,290,758	44.8%	46.50%
22	658,798.00	472,135.40	621,659.35	149,523.95	669.17	31.7%	7,471,831	50.99%	\$5,582,874	\$8,023,156	367	\$2,440,282	43.7%	50.99%
23	21,417.00	17,843.78	23,229.43	5,385.65	28.83	30.2%	7,493,248	51.14%	\$5,600,718	\$8,046,386	352	\$2,445,668	43.7%	51.14%
24	117,520.00	86,277.41	109,370.47	23,093.06	115.83	26.8%	7,610,768	51.94%	\$5,686,996	\$8,155,756	342	\$2,468,761	43.4%	51.94%
25	78,141.00	61,148.43	73,650.29	12,501.86	90.08	20.4%	7,688,909	52.48%	\$5,748,144	\$8,229,407	332	\$2,481,263	43.2%	52.48%
26	141,847.00	94,262.17	110,431.87	16,169.70	121.17	17.2%	7,830,756	53.44%	\$5,842,406	\$8,339,838	324	\$2,497,432	42.7%	53.44%
27	35,100.00	25,917.99	29,278.44	3,360.45	37.50	13.0%	7,865,856	53.68%	\$5,868,324	\$8,369,117	313	\$2,500,793	42.6%	53.68%
28	1,233,394.00	936,570.42	1,056,654.55	120,084.13	1,342.92	12.8%	9,099,250	62.10%	\$6,804,895	\$9,425,771	350	\$2,620,877	38.5%	62.10%
29	76,594.00	60,832.54	68,029.66	7,197.12	89.75	11.8%	9,175,844	62.62%	\$6,865,727	\$9,493,801	341	\$2,628,074	38.3%	62.62%
30	1,552,677.00	1,165,522.36	1,293,415.83	127,893.47	1,739.33	11.0%	10,728,521	73.22%	\$8,031,250	\$10,787,217	388	\$2,755,967	34.3%	73.22%
31	7,650.00	6,101.35	6,469.65	368.30	9.25	6.0%	10,736,171	73.27%	\$8,037,351	\$10,793,687	375	\$2,756,336	34.3%	73.27%
32	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,736,171	73.27%	\$8,037,351	\$10,793,687	364	\$2,756,336	34.3%	73.27%
33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,736,171	73.27%	\$8,037,351	\$10,793,687	353	\$2,756,336	34.3%	73.27%
34	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,736,171	73.27%	\$8,037,351	\$10,793,687	342	\$2,756,336	34.3%	73.27%
35	120,053.00	93,845.97	92,755.99	(1,089.98)	141.67	-1.2%	10,856,224	74.09%	\$8,131,197	\$10,886,443	337	\$2,755,246	33.9%	74.09%
36	2,320,289.00	1,248,819.50	1,206,235.00	(42,584.50)	1,684.00	-3.4%	13,176,513	89.93%	\$9,380,016	\$12,092,678	374	\$2,712,661	28.9%	89.93%
37	352,369.00	198,268.33	189,754.22	(8,514.11)	312.13	-4.3%	13,528,882	92.33%	\$9,578,285	\$12,282,432	372	\$2,704,147	28.2%	92.33%
38	602,696.00	478,373.39	457,849.59	(20,523.80)	728.17	-4.3%	14,131,578	96.45%	\$10,056,658	\$12,740,281	382	\$2,683,623	26.7%	96.45%
39	59,431.00	44,123.75	42,195.74	(1,928.01)	60.75	-4.4%	14,191,009	96.85%	\$10,100,782	\$12,782,477	373	\$2,681,695	26.5%	96.85%
40	318,897.00	181,870.02	173,510.26	(8,359.76)	333.71	-4.6%	14,509,906	99.03%	\$10,282,652	\$12,955,987	373	\$2,673,336	26.0%	99.03%
41	64,153.00	50,264.37	46,789.49	(3,474.88)	74.25	-6.9%	14,574,059	99.46%	\$10,332,916	\$13,002,777	365	\$2,669,861	25.8%	99.46%
42	35,046.00	27,580.43	24,681.77	(2,898.66)	41.00	-10.5%	14,609,105	99.70%	\$10,360,497	\$13,027,459	358	\$2,666,962	25.7%	99.70%
43	43,360.00	33,934.12	29,973.23	(3,960.89)	51.75	-11.7%	14,652,465	100.00%	\$10,394,431	\$13,057,432	350	\$2,663,001	25.6%	
Total	14,652,465	\$10,394,430.75	\$13,057,431.86	\$2,663,001.11	350.40	25.6%								

10.49% of Low Income residential NGS customer usage has paid 54.1% more than NFG costs

51.14% of Low Income residential NGS customer usage has paid 43.7% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME March 2016

NYD Non-Residential Sorted by % Difference							NYD Non-Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent		
1	6,512.00	4,756.37	9,492.25	4,735.88	4.00	99.6%	6,512	0.02%	\$4,756	\$9,492	4	\$4,736	99.6%	0.02%
2	28,634.00	21,153.34	39,706.39	18,553.05	17.50	87.7%	35,146	0.09%	\$25,910	\$49,199	11	\$23,289	89.9%	0.09%
3	3,105.00	1,985.50	3,543.92	1,558.42	1.29	78.5%	38,251	0.10%	\$27,895	\$52,743	8	\$24,847	89.1%	0.10%
4	18,557.00	11,326.70	19,846.78	8,520.08	3.00	75.2%	56,808	0.15%	\$39,222	\$72,589	6	\$33,367	85.1%	0.15%
5	33,037.00	23,935.77	39,237.84	15,302.07	20.00	63.9%	89,845	0.24%	\$63,158	\$111,827	9	\$48,670	77.1%	0.24%
6	3,191.00	2,626.29	4,298.47	1,672.18	3.00	63.7%	93,036	0.25%	\$65,784	\$116,126	8	\$50,342	76.5%	0.25%
7	347,210.00	244,745.94	398,076.15	153,330.21	164.00	62.6%	440,246	1.19%	\$310,530	\$514,202	30	\$203,672	65.6%	1.19%
8	1,059,027.00	683,181.48	1,101,071.99	417,890.51	398.00	61.2%	1,499,273	4.04%	\$993,711	\$1,615,274	76	\$621,562	62.5%	4.04%
9	896,093.00	519,937.95	828,324.10	308,386.15	95.42	59.3%	2,395,366	6.46%	\$1,513,649	\$2,443,598	78	\$929,949	61.4%	6.46%
10	313,079.00	193,784.00	303,039.40	109,255.40	72.58	56.4%	2,708,445	7.30%	\$1,707,433	\$2,746,637	78	\$1,039,204	60.9%	7.30%
11	5,679.00	3,866.13	5,957.47	2,091.34	2.00	54.1%	2,714,124	7.32%	\$1,711,299	\$2,752,595	71	\$1,041,295	60.8%	7.32%
12	17,242.00	11,756.59	17,824.55	6,067.96	6.00	51.6%	2,731,366	7.36%	\$1,723,056	\$2,770,419	66	\$1,047,363	60.8%	7.36%
13	44,045.00	29,945.85	44,028.15	14,082.30	18.33	47.0%	2,775,411	7.48%	\$1,753,002	\$2,814,447	62	\$1,061,446	60.6%	7.48%
14	1,192,030.00	808,978.00	1,183,143.94	374,165.94	537.42	46.3%	3,967,441	10.70%	\$2,561,980	\$3,997,591	96	\$1,435,611	56.0%	10.70%
15	1,306,477.00	866,467.08	1,231,595.88	365,128.80	520.42	42.1%	5,273,918	14.22%	\$3,428,447	\$5,229,187	124	\$1,800,740	52.5%	14.22%
16	677,385.00	474,795.34	658,586.02	183,790.68	347.00	38.7%	5,951,303	16.04%	\$3,903,242	\$5,887,773	138	\$1,984,531	50.8%	16.04%
17	140,428.00	78,772.58	109,113.60	30,341.02	3.00	38.5%	6,091,731	16.42%	\$3,982,015	\$5,996,887	130	\$2,014,872	50.6%	16.42%
18	18,811.00	11,929.24	16,509.00	4,579.76	6.00	38.4%	6,110,542	16.47%	\$3,993,944	\$6,013,396	123	\$2,019,452	50.6%	16.47%
19	463,290.00	319,171.61	435,230.41	116,058.80	230.67	36.4%	6,573,832	17.72%	\$4,313,116	\$6,448,626	129	\$2,135,511	49.5%	17.72%
20	99,515.00	66,337.30	89,662.22	23,324.92	37.58	35.2%	6,673,347	17.99%	\$4,379,453	\$6,538,289	124	\$2,158,835	49.3%	17.99%
21	9,706.00	7,122.44	9,426.66	2,304.22	5.25	32.4%	6,683,053	18.02%	\$4,386,576	\$6,547,715	119	\$2,161,140	49.3%	18.02%
22	2,785.00	2,103.44	2,736.96	633.52	2.00	30.1%	6,685,838	18.02%	\$4,388,679	\$6,550,452	113	\$2,161,773	49.3%	18.02%
23	920,979.00	581,874.21	730,482.50	148,608.29	228.17	25.5%	7,606,817	20.51%	\$4,970,553	\$7,280,935	118	\$2,310,382	46.5%	20.51%
24	344,767.00	249,412.79	310,963.33	61,550.54	202.75	24.7%	7,951,584	21.44%	\$5,219,966	\$7,591,898	122	\$2,371,932	45.4%	21.44%
25	666.00	489.05	599.64	110.59	1.00	22.6%	7,952,250	21.44%	\$5,220,455	\$7,592,498	117	\$2,372,043	45.4%	21.44%
26	11,443,435.00	6,689,800.18	8,182,932.50	1,493,132.32	1,407.67	22.3%	19,395,685	52.29%	\$11,910,255	\$15,775,430	167	\$3,865,175	32.5%	52.29%
27	884,277.00	536,559.37	651,921.82	115,362.45	159.83	21.5%	20,279,962	54.67%	\$12,446,815	\$16,427,352	166	\$3,980,537	32.0%	54.67%
28	3,664,750.00	2,220,501.21	2,693,723.98	473,222.77	667.75	21.3%	23,944,712	64.55%	\$14,667,316	\$19,121,076	184	\$4,453,760	30.4%	64.55%
29	6,781,387.00	4,094,656.38	4,877,726.33	783,069.95	1,159.33	19.1%	30,726,099	82.83%	\$18,761,972	\$23,998,802	218	\$5,236,830	27.9%	82.83%
30	1,824,845.00	1,157,035.57	1,357,552.42	200,516.85	422.33	17.3%	32,550,944	87.75%	\$19,919,008	\$25,356,355	225	\$5,437,347	27.3%	87.75%
31	410,799.00	255,544.52	286,159.82	30,615.30	81.67	12.0%	32,961,743	88.86%	\$20,174,552	\$25,642,514	220	\$5,467,962	27.1%	88.86%
32	1,285,320.00	787,674.59	863,954.27	76,279.68	257.92	9.7%	34,247,063	92.32%	\$20,962,227	\$26,506,469	221	\$5,544,242	26.4%	92.32%
33	38,857.00	22,592.09	24,496.35	1,904.26	8.00	8.4%	34,285,920	92.43%	\$20,984,819	\$26,530,965	215	\$5,546,146	26.4%	92.43%
34	400,830.00	236,139.24	254,372.13	18,232.89	41.92	7.7%	34,686,750	93.51%	\$21,220,958	\$26,785,337	210	\$5,564,379	26.2%	93.51%
35	84,027.00	51,675.46	53,789.58	2,114.12	24.00	4.1%	34,770,777	93.74%	\$21,272,634	\$26,839,127	204	\$5,566,493	26.2%	93.74%
36	2,323,137.00	1,588,834.98	1,642,626.53	53,791.55	1,041.83	3.4%	37,093,914	100.00%	\$22,861,469	\$28,481,753	228	\$5,620,285	24.6%	100.00%
Total	37,094,515	\$22,861,922.69	\$28,482,403.19	\$5,620,480.50	216	24.6%								

7.36% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid 60.8% more than NFG costs

18.02% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid 49.3% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME February 2016

Marketer	NYD Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	29,103.00	22,405.92	42,002.34	19,596.42	30.75	87.5%	29,103	0.05%	\$22,406	\$42,002	31	\$19,596	87.5%	0.05%
2	9,686.00	6,709.24	12,211.84	5,502.60	17.83	82.0%	38,789	0.06%	\$29,115	\$54,214	24	\$25,099	86.2%	0.06%
3	109,923.00	80,678.46	144,736.79	64,058.33	104.92	79.4%	148,712	0.25%	\$109,794	\$198,951	51	\$89,157	81.2%	0.25%
4	359,324.00	264,749.40	474,763.85	210,014.45	347.00	79.3%	508,036	0.85%	\$374,543	\$673,715	125	\$299,172	79.9%	0.85%
5	21,823.00	14,247.89	25,138.58	10,890.69	16.83	76.4%	529,859	0.88%	\$388,791	\$698,853	103	\$310,062	79.8%	0.88%
6	86,146.00	58,913.11	100,603.52	41,690.41	74.25	70.8%	616,005	1.03%	\$447,704	\$799,457	99	\$351,753	78.6%	1.03%
7	706,910.00	544,703.14	901,942.75	357,239.61	739.50	65.6%	1,322,915	2.21%	\$992,407	\$1,701,400	190	\$708,993	71.4%	2.21%
8	69,352.00	54,315.74	88,904.44	34,588.70	74.00	63.7%	1,392,267	2.32%	\$1,046,723	\$1,790,304	176	\$743,581	71.0%	2.32%
9	94,287.00	66,781.70	107,047.08	40,265.38	82.00	60.3%	1,486,554	2.48%	\$1,113,505	\$1,897,351	165	\$783,847	70.4%	2.48%
10	2,298,555.00	1,738,806.19	2,782,209.20	1,043,403.01	2,291.92	60.0%	3,785,109	6.31%	\$2,852,311	\$4,679,560	378	\$1,827,250	64.1%	6.31%
11	1,086,613.00	842,737.46	1,311,981.19	469,243.73	1,160.42	55.7%	4,871,722	8.12%	\$3,695,048	\$5,991,542	449	\$2,296,493	62.2%	8.12%
12	7,495,115.00	5,959,132.66	9,140,298.70	3,181,166.04	8,402.58	53.4%	12,366,837	20.62%	\$9,654,181	\$15,131,840	1,112	\$5,477,659	56.7%	20.62%
13	1,392,300.00	1,040,694.01	1,586,382.65	545,688.64	1,363.50	52.4%	13,759,137	22.94%	\$10,694,875	\$16,718,223	1,131	\$6,023,348	56.3%	22.94%
14	1,556,900.00	1,170,986.27	1,769,074.29	598,088.02	1,540.58	51.1%	15,316,037	25.54%	\$11,865,861	\$18,487,297	1,160	\$6,621,436	55.8%	25.54%
15	1,861,727.00	1,385,911.11	2,085,515.13	699,604.02	1,824.08	50.5%	17,177,764	28.64%	\$13,251,772	\$20,572,812	1,205	\$7,321,040	55.2%	28.64%
16	4,980.00	4,076.90	6,122.54	2,045.64	6.00	50.2%	17,182,744	28.65%	\$13,255,849	\$20,578,935	1,130	\$7,323,086	55.2%	28.65%
17	188,716.00	140,948.76	202,943.02	61,994.26	184.83	44.0%	17,371,460	28.97%	\$13,396,798	\$20,781,878	1,074	\$7,385,080	55.1%	28.97%
18	163,055.00	126,264.03	179,656.19	53,392.16	174.83	42.3%	17,534,515	29.24%	\$13,523,062	\$20,961,534	1,024	\$7,438,472	55.0%	29.24%
19	770,271.00	524,169.24	743,182.68	219,013.44	606.00	41.8%	18,304,786	30.52%	\$14,047,231	\$21,704,717	1,002	\$7,657,486	54.5%	30.52%
20	3,089,097.00	2,452,465.57	3,478,263.27	1,025,797.70	3,505.00	41.8%	21,393,883	35.67%	\$16,499,697	\$25,182,980	1,127	\$8,683,283	52.6%	35.67%
21	2,514,611.00	1,797,452.30	2,455,031.43	657,579.13	2,211.75	36.6%	23,908,494	39.87%	\$18,297,149	\$27,638,011	1,179	\$9,340,862	51.1%	39.87%
22	1,299,186.00	1,014,322.20	1,374,250.25	359,928.05	1,433.33	35.5%	25,207,680	42.03%	\$19,311,471	\$29,012,262	1,191	\$9,700,790	50.2%	42.03%
23	443,132.00	328,687.21	436,849.71	108,162.50	419.50	32.9%	25,650,812	42.77%	\$19,640,159	\$29,449,111	1,157	\$9,808,953	49.9%	42.77%
24	370,759.00	280,392.74	369,127.04	88,734.30	370.50	31.6%	26,021,571	43.39%	\$19,920,551	\$29,818,238	1,124	\$9,897,687	49.7%	43.39%
25	13,778.00	10,453.09	13,456.99	3,003.90	14.75	28.7%	26,035,349	43.41%	\$19,931,004	\$29,831,695	1,080	\$9,900,691	49.7%	43.41%
26	5,210,880.00	3,975,458.78	4,799,224.03	823,765.25	5,240.08	20.7%	31,246,229	52.10%	\$23,906,463	\$34,630,920	1,240	\$10,724,456	44.9%	52.10%
27	156,634.00	114,963.04	138,716.67	23,753.63	152.17	20.7%	31,402,863	52.36%	\$24,021,426	\$34,769,636	1,200	\$10,748,210	44.7%	52.36%
28	688,390.00	448,158.30	538,056.28	89,897.98	456.92	20.1%	32,091,253	53.51%	\$24,469,584	\$35,307,692	1,173	\$10,838,108	44.3%	53.51%
29	118,964.00	97,386.46	116,741.12	19,354.66	144.00	19.9%	32,210,217	53.71%	\$24,566,971	\$35,424,434	1,138	\$10,857,463	44.2%	53.71%
30	1,427,315.00	8,522,226.84	10,151,264.71	1,629,037.87	11,371.17	19.1%	43,637,532	72.77%	\$33,089,198	\$45,575,698	1,479	\$12,486,501	37.7%	72.77%
31	195,696.00	131,977.15	153,243.22	21,266.07	147.50	16.1%	43,833,228	73.09%	\$33,221,175	\$45,728,942	1,436	\$12,507,767	37.6%	73.09%
32	200,787.00	100,853.05	114,723.45	13,870.40	47.92	13.8%	44,034,015	73.43%	\$33,322,028	\$45,843,665	1,392	\$12,521,637	37.6%	73.43%
33	2,129,219.00	1,474,557.76	1,668,535.88	193,978.12	1,700.58	13.2%	46,163,234	76.98%	\$34,796,586	\$47,512,201	1,402	\$12,715,615	36.5%	76.98%
34	7,413,628.00	5,449,420.12	5,756,203.90	306,783.78	6,867.33	5.6%	53,576,862	89.34%	\$40,246,006	\$53,268,405	1,562	\$13,022,399	32.4%	89.34%
35	515,954.00	379,579.72	400,289.51	20,709.79	479.58	5.5%	54,092,816	90.20%	\$40,625,586	\$53,668,694	1,532	\$13,043,109	32.1%	90.20%
36	16,412.00	9,846.49	10,328.73	482.24	9.00	4.9%	54,109,228	90.23%	\$40,635,432	\$53,679,023	1,489	\$13,043,591	32.1%	90.23%
37	1,287,636.00	922,230.88	944,166.93	21,936.05	1,093.75	2.4%	55,396,864	92.37%	\$41,557,663	\$54,623,190	1,479	\$13,065,527	31.4%	92.37%
38	30,344.00	17,408.27	17,678.98	270.71	38.33	1.6%	55,427,208	92.43%	\$41,575,071	\$54,640,869	1,441	\$13,065,798	31.4%	92.43%
39	24,853.00	14,714.53	14,946.83	232.30	35.00	1.6%	55,452,061	92.47%	\$41,589,786	\$54,655,816	1,405	\$13,066,030	31.4%	92.47%
40	186,642.00	104,439.43	105,440.40	1,000.97	199.50	1.0%	55,638,703	92.78%	\$41,694,225	\$54,761,256	1,374	\$13,067,031	31.3%	92.78%
41	559,701.00	427,794.98	426,522.91	(1,272.07)	556.75	-0.3%	56,198,404	93.71%	\$42,122,020	\$55,187,779	1,355	\$13,065,759	31.0%	93.71%
42	3,771,371.00	1,866,219.68	1,842,911.85	(23,307.83)	811.50	-1.2%	59,969,775	100.00%	\$43,988,240	\$57,030,691	1,342	\$13,042,451	29.6%	100.00%
Total	59,969,775	\$43,988,239.82	\$57,030,690.87	\$13,042,451.05	1,341.61	29.6%								

20.62% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 56.7% more than NFG costs

42.77% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 49.9% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME February 2016

Marketer	NYD Low Income Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Low Income Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	3,381.00	2,111.25	3,918.65	1,807.40	5.00	85.6%	3,381	0.02%	\$2,111	\$3,919	5	\$1,807	85.6%	0.02%
2	5,841.00	4,916.25	8,488.54	3,572.29	7.75	72.7%	9,222	0.07%	\$7,028	\$12,407	6	\$5,380	76.6%	0.07%
3	78,336.00	51,278.17	87,142.35	35,864.18	61.50	69.9%	87,558	0.63%	\$58,306	\$99,550	25	\$41,244	70.7%	0.63%
4	12,526.00	9,969.73	16,697.73	6,728.00	15.42	67.5%	100,084	0.72%	\$68,275	\$116,247	22	\$47,972	70.3%	0.72%
5	5,170.00	3,104.12	5,010.57	1,906.45	3.75	61.4%	105,254	0.75%	\$71,380	\$121,258	19	\$49,878	69.9%	0.75%
6	24,888.00	21,044.49	33,398.72	12,354.23	32.17	58.7%	130,142	0.93%	\$92,424	\$154,657	21	\$62,233	67.3%	0.93%
7	322,453.00	248,530.35	393,522.18	144,991.83	339.08	58.3%	452,595	3.23%	\$340,954	\$548,179	66	\$207,224	60.8%	3.23%
8	14,505.00	11,486.01	17,988.18	6,502.17	16.00	56.6%	467,100	3.34%	\$352,440	\$566,167	60	\$213,727	60.6%	3.34%
9	334,671.00	263,802.38	390,233.77	126,431.39	361.33	47.9%	801,771	5.73%	\$616,243	\$956,401	94	\$340,158	55.2%	5.73%
10	5,650.00	4,309.96	6,353.70	2,043.74	5.33	47.4%	807,421	5.77%	\$620,553	\$962,754	85	\$342,202	55.1%	5.77%
11	25,894.00	19,110.57	27,996.76	8,886.19	27.42	46.5%	833,315	5.96%	\$639,663	\$990,751	80	\$351,088	54.9%	5.96%
12	635,979.00	446,549.23	648,525.30	201,976.07	576.75	45.2%	1,469,294	10.50%	\$1,086,213	\$1,639,276	121	\$553,064	50.9%	10.50%
13	212,089.00	170,982.10	247,248.16	76,266.06	249.42	44.6%	1,681,383	12.02%	\$1,257,195	\$1,886,525	131	\$629,330	50.1%	12.02%
14	1,907,240.00	1,547,825.92	2,225,780.67	677,954.75	2,230.83	43.8%	3,588,623	25.65%	\$2,805,021	\$4,112,305	281	\$1,307,285	46.6%	25.65%
15	5,712.00	3,087.68	4,433.13	1,345.45	2.75	43.6%	3,594,335	25.69%	\$2,808,108	\$4,116,738	262	\$1,308,630	46.6%	25.69%
16	470,193.00	363,230.04	523,477.21	155,247.17	532.75	42.2%	4,064,528	29.05%	\$3,176,338	\$4,640,216	279	\$1,463,877	46.1%	29.05%
17	368,911.00	276,831.67	388,016.96	111,185.29	371.25	40.2%	4,433,439	31.69%	\$3,453,170	\$5,028,233	285	\$1,575,063	45.6%	31.69%
18	1,475,221.00	1,141,546.57	1,562,232.73	420,686.16	1,612.25	36.9%	5,908,660	42.23%	\$4,594,716	\$6,590,465	358	\$1,995,749	43.4%	42.23%
19	104,164.00	82,133.92	109,366.18	27,232.26	116.17	33.2%	6,012,824	42.98%	\$4,676,850	\$6,699,831	346	\$2,022,981	43.3%	42.98%
20	104,558.00	78,718.73	104,562.42	25,843.69	106.17	32.8%	6,117,382	43.72%	\$4,755,569	\$6,804,394	334	\$2,048,825	43.1%	43.72%
21	609,813.00	455,088.16	603,001.04	147,912.88	638.33	32.5%	6,727,195	48.08%	\$5,210,657	\$7,407,395	348	\$2,196,738	42.2%	48.08%
22	21,814.00	18,312.36	23,486.18	5,173.82	27.67	28.3%	6,749,009	48.24%	\$5,228,970	\$7,430,881	334	\$2,201,911	42.1%	48.24%
23	597,498.00	450,276.82	569,547.58	119,270.76	601.92	26.5%	7,346,507	52.51%	\$5,679,246	\$8,000,429	345	\$2,321,182	40.9%	52.51%
24	120,483.00	91,299.60	114,151.71	22,852.11	115.75	25.0%	7,466,990	53.37%	\$5,770,546	\$8,114,580	336	\$2,344,034	40.6%	53.37%
25	83,872.00	66,216.58	80,023.51	13,806.93	90.83	20.9%	7,550,862	53.97%	\$5,836,763	\$8,194,604	326	\$2,357,841	40.4%	53.97%
26	134,922.00	94,205.32	109,627.92	15,422.60	121.00	16.4%	7,685,784	54.93%	\$5,930,968	\$8,304,232	318	\$2,373,264	40.0%	54.93%
27	1,258,326.00	982,145.83	1,102,188.70	120,042.87	1,345.17	12.2%	8,944,110	63.93%	\$6,913,114	\$9,406,421	356	\$2,493,307	36.1%	63.93%
28	34,256.00	25,863.25	29,003.47	3,140.22	35.75	12.1%	8,978,366	64.17%	\$6,938,977	\$9,435,424	345	\$2,496,447	36.0%	64.17%
29	81,865.00	65,835.93	73,478.85	7,642.92	90.75	11.6%	9,060,231	64.76%	\$7,004,813	\$9,508,903	336	\$2,504,090	35.7%	64.76%
30	1,559,383.00	1,201,575.42	1,327,821.70	126,246.28	1,716.50	10.5%	10,619,614	75.90%	\$8,206,388	\$10,836,725	382	\$2,630,336	32.1%	75.90%
31	7,695.00	6,277.17	6,535.34	258.17	9.08	4.1%	10,627,309	75.96%	\$8,212,666	\$10,843,260	370	\$2,630,594	32.0%	75.96%
32	123,095.00	98,209.02	99,729.25	1,520.23	141.08	1.5%	10,750,404	76.84%	\$8,310,875	\$10,942,989	363	\$2,632,115	31.7%	76.84%
33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,750,404	76.84%	\$8,310,875	\$10,942,989	352	\$2,632,115	31.7%	76.84%
34	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,750,404	76.84%	\$8,310,875	\$10,942,989	341	\$2,632,115	31.7%	76.84%
35	1,874,598.00	1,048,388.77	1,032,371.75	(16,017.02)	1,677.50	-1.5%	12,625,002	90.23%	\$9,359,263	\$11,975,361	380	\$2,616,098	28.0%	90.23%
36	288,328.00	168,889.81	165,469.54	(3,420.27)	315.81	-2.0%	12,913,330	92.30%	\$9,528,153	\$12,140,830	378	\$2,612,677	27.4%	92.30%
37	247,547.00	148,749.34	144,972.82	(3,776.52)	342.50	-2.5%	13,160,877	94.06%	\$9,676,903	\$12,285,803	377	\$2,608,901	27.0%	94.06%
38	57,515.00	43,731.75	41,480.82	(2,250.93)	57.67	-5.1%	13,218,392	94.48%	\$9,720,634	\$12,327,284	368	\$2,606,650	26.8%	94.48%
39	623,801.00	502,417.47	475,564.25	(26,853.22)	721.25	-5.3%	13,842,193	98.93%	\$10,223,052	\$12,802,848	377	\$2,579,797	25.2%	98.93%
40	66,507.00	53,086.32	49,168.56	(3,917.76)	74.00	-7.4%	13,908,700	99.41%	\$10,276,138	\$12,852,017	370	\$2,575,879	25.1%	99.41%
41	45,497.00	36,211.18	32,979.19	(3,231.99)	52.00	-8.9%	13,954,197	99.73%	\$10,312,349	\$12,884,996	362	\$2,572,647	24.9%	99.73%
42	37,152.00	29,398.07	26,723.59	(2,674.48)	41.00	-9.1%	13,991,349	100.00%	\$10,341,747	\$12,911,720	354	\$2,569,972	24.9%	100.00%
Total	13,991,349	\$10,341,747.31	\$12,911,719.68	\$2,569,972.37	354.49	24.9%								

10.5% of Low Income residential  
NGS customer usage has paid 50.9%  
more than NFG costs

52.51% of Low Income residential  
NGS customer usage has paid 40.9%  
more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME February 2016

Marketer	NYD Non-Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Non-Residential Cumulative							% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent	
1	6,973.00	5,194.49	10,001.33	4,806.84	4.00	92.5%	6,973	0.02%	\$5,194	\$10,001	4	\$4,807	92.5%	0.02%
2	35,039.00	26,260.80	46,483.33	20,222.53	18.33	77.0%	42,012	0.11%	\$31,455	\$56,485	11	\$25,029	79.6%	0.11%
3	2,588.00	1,730.29	3,012.48	1,282.19	1.67	74.1%	44,600	0.12%	\$33,186	\$59,497	8	\$26,312	79.3%	0.12%
4	32,760.00	20,618.88	34,791.90	14,173.02	5.00	68.7%	77,360	0.20%	\$53,804	\$94,289	7	\$40,485	75.2%	0.20%
5	35,023.00	25,972.78	41,717.90	15,745.12	20.00	60.6%	112,383	0.29%	\$79,777	\$136,007	10	\$56,230	70.5%	0.29%
6	3,416.00	2,839.05	4,550.38	1,711.33	3.00	60.3%	115,799	0.30%	\$82,616	\$140,557	9	\$57,941	70.1%	0.30%
7	378,677.00	274,251.62	437,977.47	163,725.85	171.83	59.7%	494,476	1.29%	\$356,868	\$578,535	32	\$221,667	62.1%	1.29%
8	1,026,204.00	685,892.54	1,077,830.22	391,937.68	398.92	57.1%	1,520,680	3.96%	\$1,042,760	\$1,656,365	78	\$613,605	58.8%	3.96%
9	877,953.00	525,255.60	810,421.99	285,166.39	94.67	54.3%	2,398,633	6.24%	\$1,568,016	\$2,466,787	80	\$898,771	57.3%	6.24%
10	5,992.00	4,132.69	6,263.54	2,130.85	2.00	51.6%	2,404,625	6.26%	\$1,572,149	\$2,473,051	72	\$900,902	57.3%	6.26%
11	18,196.00	12,659.73	18,841.34	6,181.61	6.00	48.8%	2,422,821	6.31%	\$1,584,808	\$2,491,892	66	\$907,083	57.2%	6.31%
12	324,259.00	209,093.47	310,320.85	101,227.38	74.83	48.4%	2,747,080	7.15%	\$1,793,902	\$2,802,213	67	\$1,008,311	56.2%	7.15%
13	46,386.00	32,382.95	46,120.07	13,737.12	18.92	42.4%	2,793,466	7.27%	\$1,826,285	\$2,848,333	63	\$1,022,048	56.0%	7.27%
14	1,205,670.00	841,144.74	1,183,632.87	342,488.13	530.67	40.7%	3,999,136	10.41%	\$2,667,430	\$4,031,966	96	\$1,364,536	51.2%	10.41%
15	13,984.00	9,162.22	12,509.45	3,347.23	5.25	36.5%	4,013,020	10.44%	\$2,676,592	\$4,044,475	90	\$1,367,883	51.1%	10.44%
16	10,422.00	7,952.49	10,760.36	2,807.87	6.08	35.3%	4,023,442	10.47%	\$2,684,544	\$4,055,235	85	\$1,370,691	51.1%	10.47%
17	148,766.00	86,122.91	114,936.36	28,813.45	3.00	33.5%	4,172,208	10.86%	\$2,770,667	\$4,170,172	80	\$1,399,505	50.5%	10.86%
18	91,635.00	63,522.67	84,483.04	20,960.37	36.58	33.0%	4,263,843	11.10%	\$2,834,190	\$4,254,655	78	\$1,420,465	50.1%	11.10%
19	743,603.00	534,615.31	710,015.82	175,400.51	362.58	32.8%	5,007,446	13.03%	\$3,368,805	\$4,964,671	93	\$1,595,865	47.4%	13.03%
20	498,544.00	354,306.73	469,138.51	114,831.78	238.00	32.4%	5,505,990	14.33%	\$3,723,112	\$5,433,809	100	\$1,710,697	45.9%	14.33%
21	1,383,107.00	944,407.66	1,246,241.61	301,833.95	524.17	32.0%	6,889,097	17.93%	\$4,667,520	\$6,680,051	120	\$2,012,531	43.1%	17.93%
22	2,984.00	2,327.21	3,008.33	681.12	2.00	29.3%	6,892,081	17.94%	\$4,669,847	\$6,683,059	115	\$2,013,212	43.1%	17.94%
23	970,550.00	631,857.82	783,194.66	151,336.84	232.17	24.0%	7,862,631	20.46%	\$5,301,705	\$7,466,254	120	\$2,164,549	40.8%	20.46%
24	364,186.00	269,854.48	330,288.93	60,434.45	205.17	22.4%	8,226,817	21.41%	\$5,571,559	\$7,796,543	124	\$2,224,984	39.9%	21.41%
25	439.00	348.21	423.11	74.90	1.00	21.5%	8,227,256	21.41%	\$5,571,907	\$7,796,966	119	\$2,225,059	39.9%	21.41%
26	12,020,251.00	7,273,628.09	8,736,354.23	1,462,726.14	1,422.50	20.1%	20,247,507	52.69%	\$12,845,535	\$16,533,320	169	\$3,687,785	28.7%	52.69%
27	3,562,538.00	2,229,191.49	2,667,345.79	438,154.30	646.25	19.7%	23,810,045	61.97%	\$15,074,727	\$19,200,666	186	\$4,125,939	27.4%	61.97%
28	912,674.00	573,258.15	684,618.06	111,359.91	165.17	19.4%	24,722,719	64.34%	\$15,647,985	\$19,885,284	186	\$4,237,299	27.1%	64.34%
29	7,196,552.00	4,492,997.86	5,271,292.07	778,294.21	1,157.00	17.3%	31,919,271	83.07%	\$20,140,983	\$25,156,576	219	\$5,015,593	24.9%	83.07%
30	1,837,238.00	1,199,042.88	1,374,139.96	175,097.08	418.17	14.6%	33,756,509	87.85%	\$21,340,026	\$26,530,716	226	\$5,190,690	24.3%	87.85%
31	408,256.00	262,466.14	289,324.69	26,858.55	80.83	10.2%	34,164,765	88.92%	\$21,602,492	\$26,820,041	221	\$5,217,549	24.2%	88.92%
32	1,350,113.00	854,614.55	930,765.89	76,151.34	256.42	8.9%	35,514,878	92.43%	\$22,457,107	\$27,750,807	222	\$5,293,700	23.6%	92.43%
33	39,689.00	23,578.36	25,185.43	1,607.07	7.00	6.8%	35,554,567	92.53%	\$22,480,685	\$27,775,992	216	\$5,295,307	23.6%	92.53%
34	401,804.00	243,705.36	256,282.19	12,576.83	41.00	5.2%	35,956,371	93.58%	\$22,724,390	\$28,032,274	211	\$5,307,884	23.4%	93.58%
35	88,430.00	55,842.87	58,351.50	2,508.63	25.00	4.5%	36,044,801	93.81%	\$22,780,233	\$28,090,626	205	\$5,310,393	23.3%	93.81%
36	2,379,233.00	1,669,473.17	1,740,151.01	70,677.84	1,032.67	4.2%	38,424,034	100.00%	\$24,449,706	\$29,830,777	228	\$5,381,070	22.0%	100.00%
Total	38,424,383	\$24,450,019.07	\$29,831,223.42	\$5,381,204.35	216	22.0%								

7.15% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid 56.2% more than NFG costs

17.94% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid 43.1% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME January 2016

Marketer	NYD Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Residential Cumulative						% of Total Usage	
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference		Percent
1	17,110.00	11,664.12	21,135.41	9,471.29	13.83	81.2%	17,110	0.03%	\$11,664	\$21,135	14	\$9,471	81.2%	0.03%
2	30,736.00	24,327.02	43,432.42	19,105.40	31.58	78.5%	47,846	0.08%	\$35,991	\$64,568	23	\$28,577	79.4%	0.08%
3	6,790.00	5,031.59	8,830.76	3,799.17	17.20	75.5%	54,636	0.09%	\$41,023	\$73,399	21	\$32,376	78.9%	0.09%
4	356,405.00	273,066.17	477,645.39	204,579.22	345.67	74.9%	411,041	0.66%	\$314,089	\$551,044	102	\$236,955	75.4%	0.66%
5	115,580.00	87,261.93	151,110.68	63,848.75	106.33	73.2%	526,621	0.85%	\$401,351	\$702,155	103	\$300,804	74.9%	0.85%
6	67,691.00	49,678.93	81,167.04	31,488.11	65.83	63.4%	594,312	0.96%	\$451,030	\$783,322	97	\$332,292	73.7%	0.96%
7	740,759.00	585,320.05	935,335.72	350,015.67	744.83	59.8%	1,335,071	2.15%	\$1,036,350	\$1,718,657	189	\$682,308	65.8%	2.15%
8	74,465.00	59,277.59	93,874.40	34,596.81	75.00	58.4%	1,409,536	2.27%	\$1,095,627	\$1,812,532	175	\$716,904	65.4%	2.27%
9	2,484,384.00	1,912,463.52	3,006,354.19	1,093,890.67	2,325.83	57.2%	3,893,920	6.28%	\$3,008,091	\$4,818,886	414	\$1,810,795	60.2%	6.28%
10	93,918.00	68,832.67	106,896.16	38,063.49	80.25	55.3%	3,987,838	6.43%	\$3,076,924	\$4,925,782	381	\$1,848,859	60.1%	6.43%
11	1,158,367.00	917,159.17	1,400,477.59	483,318.42	1,177.17	52.7%	5,146,205	8.30%	\$3,994,083	\$6,326,260	453	\$2,332,177	58.4%	8.30%
12	7,971,849.00	6,463,259.52	9,740,800.59	3,277,541.07	8,515.75	50.7%	13,118,054	21.15%	\$10,457,342	\$16,067,060	1,125	\$5,609,718	53.6%	21.15%
13	1,574,015.00	1,222,373.42	1,826,088.66	603,715.24	1,523.17	49.4%	14,692,069	23.69%	\$11,679,716	\$17,893,149	1,156	\$6,213,433	53.2%	23.69%
14	1,922,940.00	1,474,448.72	2,181,041.93	706,593.21	1,830.92	47.9%	16,615,009	26.79%	\$13,154,164	\$20,074,191	1,204	\$6,920,027	52.6%	26.79%
15	1,364,097.00	1,060,279.26	1,568,211.93	507,932.67	1,340.83	47.9%	17,979,106	28.99%	\$14,214,444	\$21,642,403	1,213	\$7,427,959	52.3%	28.99%
16	5,175.00	4,329.46	6,274.16	1,944.70	6.00	44.9%	17,984,281	29.00%	\$14,218,773	\$21,648,677	1,138	\$7,429,904	52.3%	29.00%
17	191,682.00	148,022.95	206,396.12	58,373.17	184.83	39.4%	18,175,963	29.31%	\$14,366,796	\$21,855,073	1,081	\$7,488,277	52.1%	29.31%
18	178,384.00	140,884.83	194,801.81	53,916.98	182.00	38.3%	18,354,347	29.60%	\$14,507,681	\$22,049,875	1,032	\$7,542,194	52.0%	29.60%
19	3,107,928.00	2,549,656.43	3,482,921.00	933,264.57	3,489.08	36.6%	21,462,275	34.61%	\$17,057,337	\$25,532,796	1,161	\$8,475,459	49.7%	34.61%
20	770,753.00	545,283.83	738,839.25	193,555.42	598.92	35.5%	22,233,028	35.85%	\$17,602,621	\$26,271,635	1,133	\$8,669,014	49.2%	35.85%
21	1,175,985.00	969,458.20	1,285,161.34	315,703.14	1,372.50	32.6%	23,409,013	37.75%	\$18,572,079	\$27,556,797	1,144	\$8,984,717	48.4%	37.75%
22	396,869.00	306,676.70	403,130.68	96,453.98	377.00	31.5%	23,805,882	38.39%	\$18,878,756	\$27,959,927	1,109	\$9,081,171	48.1%	38.39%
23	436,523.00	337,148.88	440,618.09	103,469.21	413.92	30.7%	24,242,405	39.09%	\$19,215,905	\$28,400,545	1,079	\$9,184,640	47.8%	39.09%
24	12,378.00	9,845.64	12,367.64	2,522.00	13.50	25.6%	24,254,783	39.11%	\$19,225,751	\$28,412,913	1,035	\$9,187,162	47.8%	39.11%
25	2,512,863.00	1,858,592.95	2,319,968.01	461,375.06	2,155.08	24.8%	26,767,646	43.17%	\$21,084,344	\$30,732,881	1,079	\$9,648,537	45.8%	43.17%
26	5,485,874.00	4,285,740.18	5,105,758.64	820,018.46	5,275.83	19.1%	32,253,520	52.01%	\$25,370,084	\$35,838,640	1,241	\$10,468,556	41.3%	52.01%
27	126,834.00	105,853.36	125,598.90	19,745.54	146.75	18.7%	32,380,354	52.22%	\$25,475,937	\$35,964,239	1,200	\$10,488,301	41.2%	52.22%
28	150,766.00	115,480.72	136,785.62	21,304.90	148.58	18.4%	32,531,120	52.46%	\$25,591,418	\$36,101,024	1,163	\$10,509,606	41.1%	52.46%
29	11,721,270.00	8,992,786.26	10,617,360.51	1,624,574.25	11,343.58	18.1%	44,252,390	71.36%	\$34,584,204	\$46,718,385	1,514	\$12,134,181	35.1%	71.36%
30	688,748.00	466,278.56	542,885.34	76,606.78	449.08	16.4%	44,941,138	72.47%	\$35,050,483	\$47,261,270	1,478	\$12,210,787	34.8%	72.47%
31	200,193.00	138,831.08	156,134.22	17,303.14	143.92	12.5%	45,141,331	72.80%	\$35,189,314	\$47,417,404	1,435	\$12,228,090	34.7%	72.80%
32	2,213,866.00	1,579,470.87	1,764,041.35	184,570.48	1,698.17	11.7%	47,355,197	76.37%	\$36,768,785	\$49,181,446	1,444	\$12,412,661	33.8%	76.37%
33	216,184.00	114,373.87	127,020.15	12,646.28	47.67	11.1%	47,571,381	76.71%	\$36,883,158	\$49,308,466	1,401	\$12,425,307	33.7%	76.71%
34	7,764,544.00	5,853,777.70	6,057,586.58	203,808.88	6,877.58	3.5%	55,335,925	89.24%	\$42,736,936	\$55,366,052	1,562	\$12,629,116	29.6%	89.24%
35	534,160.00	404,646.71	416,672.25	12,025.54	480.00	3.0%	55,870,085	90.10%	\$43,141,583	\$55,782,725	1,531	\$12,641,142	29.3%	90.10%
36	17,285.00	10,851.41	10,977.62	126.21	9.00	1.2%	55,887,370	90.13%	\$43,152,434	\$55,793,702	1,489	\$12,641,268	29.3%	90.13%
37	1,354,240.00	995,913.28	998,570.16	2,656.88	1,095.83	0.3%	57,241,610	92.31%	\$44,148,348	\$56,792,272	1,478	\$12,643,925	28.6%	92.31%
38	20,606.00	13,036.22	12,985.29	(50.93)	39.80	-0.4%	57,262,216	92.34%	\$44,161,384	\$56,805,258	1,441	\$12,643,874	28.6%	92.34%
39	15,130.00	9,840.95	9,790.00	(50.95)	32.40	-0.5%	57,277,346	92.37%	\$44,171,225	\$56,815,048	1,404	\$12,643,823	28.6%	92.37%
40	597,720.00	465,131.77	460,314.25	(4,817.52)	558.75	-1.0%	57,875,066	93.33%	\$44,636,356	\$57,275,362	1,383	\$12,639,005	28.3%	93.33%
41	132,818.00	80,176.73	79,324.06	(852.67)	171.67	-1.1%	58,007,884	93.55%	\$44,716,533	\$57,354,686	1,354	\$12,638,153	28.3%	93.55%
42	4,002,739.00	2,102,341.59	2,070,147.96	(32,193.63)	808.58	-1.5%	62,010,623	100.00%	\$46,818,875	\$59,424,834	1,341	\$12,605,959	26.9%	100.00%
Total	62,010,623	\$46,818,874.81	\$59,424,833.87	\$12,605,959.06	1,340.82	26.9%								

21.15% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 53.6% more than NFG costs

39.09% of residential NGS customer usage has paid 47.8% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME January 2016

Marketer	NYD Low Income Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Low Income Residential Cumulative								% of Total Usage
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference	Percent		
1	2,199.00	1,501.20	2,688.69	1,187.49	4.80	79.1%	2,199	0.02%	\$1,501	\$2,689	5	\$1,187	79.1%	0.02%	
2	6,530.00	5,453.98	9,097.19	3,643.21	7.67	66.8%	8,729	0.07%	\$6,955	\$11,786	6	\$4,831	69.5%	0.07%	
3	11,921.00	9,960.98	16,556.50	6,595.52	14.50	66.2%	20,650	0.16%	\$16,916	\$28,342	9	\$11,426	67.5%	0.16%	
4	54,640.00	39,311.76	63,697.92	24,386.16	49.93	62.0%	75,290	0.58%	\$56,228	\$92,040	19	\$35,812	63.7%	0.58%	
5	2,885.00	1,964.03	3,176.56	1,212.53	2.50	61.7%	78,175	0.60%	\$58,192	\$95,217	16	\$37,025	63.6%	0.60%	
6	26,725.00	22,975.84	35,763.46	12,787.62	33.00	55.7%	104,900	0.80%	\$81,168	\$130,980	19	\$49,813	61.4%	0.80%	
7	325,394.00	260,341.37	396,935.07	136,593.70	338.42	52.5%	430,294	3.29%	\$341,509	\$527,915	64	\$186,406	54.6%	3.29%	
8	15,320.00	12,367.70	18,786.41	6,418.71	16.00	51.9%	445,614	3.41%	\$353,877	\$546,702	58	\$192,825	54.5%	3.41%	
9	357,929.00	288,270.29	421,204.36	132,934.07	369.00	46.1%	803,543	6.15%	\$642,147	\$967,906	93	\$325,759	50.7%	6.15%	
10	21,909.00	17,494.39	25,020.03	7,525.64	25.67	43.0%	825,452	6.31%	\$659,642	\$992,926	86	\$333,285	50.5%	6.31%	
11	223,876.00	184,109.45	262,665.30	78,555.85	251.00	42.7%	1,049,328	8.03%	\$843,751	\$1,255,591	101	\$411,841	48.8%	8.03%	
12	5,611.00	4,431.29	6,301.18	1,869.89	5.25	42.2%	1,054,939	8.07%	\$848,182	\$1,261,893	93	\$413,710	48.8%	8.07%	
13	1,999,748.00	1,658,858.69	2,348,777.21	689,918.52	2,247.50	41.6%	3,054,687	23.37%	\$2,507,041	\$3,610,670	259	\$1,103,629	44.0%	23.37%	
14	460,708.00	374,726.86	523,626.94	148,900.08	519.75	39.7%	3,515,395	26.89%	\$2,881,768	\$4,134,297	277	\$1,252,529	43.5%	26.89%	
15	517,706.00	396,124.95	552,627.74	156,502.79	530.25	39.5%	4,033,101	30.85%	\$3,277,893	\$4,686,925	294	\$1,409,032	43.0%	30.85%	
16	338,422.00	271,390.12	378,116.54	106,726.42	356.75	39.3%	4,371,523	33.44%	\$3,549,283	\$5,065,041	298	\$1,515,758	42.7%	33.44%	
17	3,267.00	2,029.72	2,752.64	722.92	2.08	35.6%	4,374,790	33.47%	\$3,551,313	\$5,067,794	281	\$1,516,481	42.7%	33.47%	
18	1,371,908.00	1,122,211.61	1,469,968.80	347,757.19	1,550.67	31.0%	5,746,698	43.96%	\$4,673,524	\$6,537,763	351	\$1,864,238	39.9%	43.96%	
19	106,370.00	86,702.15	112,206.45	25,504.30	117.08	29.4%	5,853,068	44.78%	\$4,760,226	\$6,649,969	339	\$1,889,743	39.7%	44.78%	
20	531,895.00	426,229.60	551,196.47	124,966.87	602.92	29.3%	6,384,963	48.85%	\$5,186,456	\$7,201,165	352	\$2,014,709	38.8%	48.85%	
21	101,569.00	79,894.48	101,795.53	21,901.05	103.58	27.4%	6,486,532	49.62%	\$5,266,350	\$7,302,961	340	\$2,036,611	38.7%	49.62%	
22	22,430.00	19,175.17	24,109.91	4,934.74	27.25	25.7%	6,508,962	49.80%	\$5,285,526	\$7,327,071	326	\$2,041,545	38.6%	49.80%	
23	119,942.00	94,978.18	117,121.39	22,143.21	115.75	23.3%	6,628,904	50.71%	\$5,380,504	\$7,444,192	317	\$2,063,688	38.4%	50.71%	
24	89,469.00	72,421.46	87,863.14	15,441.68	93.00	21.3%	6,718,373	51.40%	\$5,452,925	\$7,532,055	308	\$2,079,130	38.1%	51.40%	
25	578,996.00	457,373.80	530,680.26	73,306.46	588.50	16.0%	7,297,369	55.83%	\$5,910,299	\$8,062,736	319	\$2,152,437	36.4%	55.83%	
26	112,529.00	85,787.99	97,930.80	12,142.81	113.58	14.2%	7,409,898	56.69%	\$5,996,087	\$8,160,666	311	\$2,164,579	36.1%	56.69%	
27	1,277,079.00	1,031,132.03	1,147,035.22	115,903.19	1,338.00	11.2%	8,686,977	66.46%	\$7,027,219	\$9,307,702	349	\$2,280,483	32.5%	66.46%	
28	86,325.00	71,069.14	78,755.96	7,686.82	91.67	10.8%	8,773,302	67.12%	\$7,098,288	\$9,386,458	340	\$2,288,169	32.2%	67.12%	
29	1,543,237.00	1,232,712.60	1,353,119.76	120,407.16	1,678.50	9.8%	10,316,539	78.92%	\$8,331,001	\$10,739,577	386	\$2,408,577	28.9%	78.92%	
30	33,368.00	25,873.92	28,350.93	2,477.01	33.67	9.6%	10,349,907	79.18%	\$8,356,875	\$10,767,928	374	\$2,411,054	28.9%	79.18%	
31	125,780.00	102,961.58	104,697.05	1,735.47	139.17	1.7%	10,475,687	80.14%	\$8,459,836	\$10,872,625	367	\$2,412,789	28.5%	80.14%	
32	7,839.00	6,522.13	6,629.55	107.42	8.92	1.6%	10,483,526	80.20%	\$8,466,358	\$10,879,255	356	\$2,412,897	28.5%	80.20%	
33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,483,526	80.20%	\$8,466,358	\$10,879,255	345	\$2,412,897	28.5%	80.20%	
34	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	10,483,526	80.20%	\$8,466,358	\$10,879,255	335	\$2,412,897	28.5%	80.20%	
35	201,913.00	127,682.02	127,029.75	(652.27)	301.53	-0.5%	10,685,439	81.75%	\$8,594,040	\$11,006,285	334	\$2,412,244	28.1%	81.75%	
36	1,360,666.00	816,322.37	811,238.09	(5,084.28)	1,679.33	-0.6%	12,046,105	92.16%	\$9,410,363	\$11,817,523	371	\$2,407,160	25.6%	92.16%	
37	168,211.00	110,495.92	109,198.72	(1,297.20)	335.00	-1.2%	12,214,316	93.44%	\$9,520,859	\$11,926,722	370	\$2,405,863	25.3%	93.44%	
38	58,833.00	45,790.16	42,803.24	(2,986.92)	56.50	-6.5%	12,273,149	93.89%	\$9,566,649	\$11,969,525	362	\$2,402,876	25.1%	93.89%	
39	642,583.00	528,778.87	493,988.71	(34,790.16)	711.25	-6.6%	12,915,732	98.81%	\$10,095,428	\$12,463,513	371	\$2,368,086	23.5%	98.81%	
40	45,624.00	37,283.12	34,440.79	(2,842.33)	50.33	-7.6%	12,961,356	99.16%	\$10,132,711	\$12,497,954	363	\$2,365,243	23.3%	99.16%	
41	69,939.00	56,824.35	52,000.66	(4,823.69)	73.75	-8.5%	13,031,295	99.69%	\$10,189,535	\$12,549,955	356	\$2,360,420	23.2%	99.69%	
42	40,218.00	32,046.12	29,183.14	(2,862.98)	41.00	-8.9%	13,071,513	100.00%	\$10,221,581	\$12,579,138	348	\$2,357,557	23.1%	100.00%	
							13,071,513	100.00%	\$10,221,581	\$12,579,138	348	\$2,357,557	23.1%	100.00%	
Total	13,071,513	\$10,221,581.39	\$12,579,138.06	\$2,357,556.67	348.21	23.1%									

8.07% of Low Income residential NGS customer usage has paid 48.8% more than NFG costs

50.71% of Low Income residential NGS customer usage has paid 38.4% more than NFG costs

National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation  
New York and Pennsylvania Division  
Comparison of Marketer vs. Bundled Bill by customer class  
TME January 2016

Marketer	NYD Non-Residential Sorted by % Difference						NYD Non-Residential Cummulative						% of Total Usage	
	Usage	Bundled	Marketer bill	Difference	Ave. Bills	Percent	Usage	Percent	Bundled	Marketer bill	Ave. Bills	Difference		Percent
1	7,435.00	5,678.16	10,415.30	4,737.14	4.00	83.4%	7,435	0.02%	\$5,678	\$10,415	4	\$4,737	83.4%	0.02%
2	38,238.00	29,225.34	49,573.96	20,348.62	18.17	69.6%	45,673	0.12%	\$34,904	\$59,989	11	\$25,086	71.9%	0.12%
3	1,496.00	1,054.12	1,779.69	725.57	1.40	68.8%	47,169	0.12%	\$35,958	\$61,769	8	\$25,811	71.8%	0.12%
4	33,521.00	21,619.22	35,341.25	13,722.03	5.00	63.5%	80,690	0.20%	\$57,577	\$97,110	7	\$39,533	68.7%	0.20%
5	38,111.00	28,996.62	45,572.84	16,576.22	20.00	57.2%	118,801	0.30%	\$86,573	\$142,683	10	\$56,110	64.8%	0.30%
6	409,511.00	305,727.33	474,745.56	169,018.23	176.33	55.3%	528,312	1.33%	\$392,301	\$617,429	37	\$225,128	57.4%	1.33%
7	3,587.00	3,049.15	4,715.18	1,666.03	3.00	54.6%	531,899	1.34%	\$395,350	\$622,144	33	\$226,794	57.4%	1.34%
8	991,410.00	690,913.37	1,048,945.57	358,032.20	398.83	51.8%	1,523,309	3.84%	\$1,086,263	\$1,671,089	78	\$584,826	53.8%	3.84%
9	849,340.00	527,029.66	784,107.71	257,078.05	92.08	48.8%	2,372,649	5.99%	\$1,613,293	\$2,455,197	80	\$841,904	52.2%	5.99%
10	6,095.00	4,326.59	6,365.53	2,038.94	2.00	47.1%	2,378,744	6.00%	\$1,617,620	\$2,461,563	72	\$843,943	52.2%	6.00%
11	18,812.00	13,464.25	19,499.26	6,035.01	6.00	44.8%	2,397,556	6.05%	\$1,631,084	\$2,481,062	66	\$849,978	52.1%	6.05%
12	346,183.00	231,552.84	325,493.17	93,940.33	75.00	40.6%	2,743,739	6.92%	\$1,862,637	\$2,806,555	67	\$943,918	50.7%	6.92%
13	41,069.00	29,942.31	40,846.28	10,903.97	18.25	36.4%	2,784,808	7.03%	\$1,892,579	\$2,847,401	63	\$954,822	50.5%	7.03%
14	1,192,029.00	861,027.47	1,158,046.61	297,019.14	518.08	34.5%	3,976,837	10.03%	\$2,753,606	\$4,005,448	96	\$1,251,841	45.5%	10.03%
15	9,754.00	7,620.55	10,225.88	2,605.33	5.75	34.2%	3,986,591	10.06%	\$2,761,227	\$4,015,674	90	\$1,254,447	45.4%	10.06%
16	8,705.00	6,165.99	8,244.75	2,078.76	4.42	33.7%	3,995,296	10.08%	\$2,767,393	\$4,023,919	84	\$1,256,526	45.4%	10.08%
17	77,696.00	57,079.04	74,585.31	17,506.27	34.33	30.7%	4,072,992	10.28%	\$2,824,472	\$4,098,504	81	\$1,274,032	45.1%	10.28%
18	539,919.00	394,955.53	512,396.34	117,440.81	243.33	29.7%	4,612,911	11.64%	\$3,219,428	\$4,610,900	90	\$1,391,473	43.2%	11.64%
19	3,246.00	2,584.73	3,340.33	755.60	2.00	29.2%	4,616,157	11.65%	\$3,222,012	\$4,614,241	86	\$1,392,228	43.2%	11.65%
20	809,352.00	599,537.69	764,524.98	164,987.29	375.08	27.5%	5,425,509	13.69%	\$3,821,550	\$5,378,766	100	\$1,557,216	40.7%	13.69%
21	160,281.00	96,675.72	123,289.81	26,614.09	3.00	27.5%	5,585,790	14.09%	\$3,918,226	\$5,502,055	96	\$1,583,830	40.4%	14.09%
22	1,034,703.00	696,705.57	848,351.15	151,645.58	236.08	21.8%	6,620,493	16.70%	\$4,614,931	\$6,350,406	102	\$1,735,475	37.6%	16.70%
23	294.00	247.71	301.08	53.37	1.00	21.5%	6,620,787	16.70%	\$4,615,179	\$6,350,708	98	\$1,735,529	37.6%	16.70%
24	1,436,085.00	1,017,101.83	1,225,134.45	208,032.62	524.75	20.5%	8,056,872	20.33%	\$5,632,281	\$7,575,842	115	\$1,943,561	34.5%	20.33%
25	377,790.00	287,842.83	345,833.50	57,990.67	205.83	20.1%	8,434,662	21.28%	\$5,920,124	\$7,921,675	119	\$2,001,552	33.8%	21.28%
26	1,007,964.00	654,963.41	768,023.23	113,059.82	167.83	17.3%	9,442,626	23.82%	\$6,575,087	\$8,689,699	121	\$2,114,612	32.2%	23.82%
27	12,489,684.00	7,865,129.29	9,197,036.03	1,331,906.74	1,420.42	16.9%	21,932,310	55.34%	\$14,440,216	\$17,886,735	169	\$3,446,518	23.9%	55.34%
28	3,482,178.00	2,261,799.17	2,623,392.66	361,593.49	627.25	16.0%	25,414,488	64.12%	\$16,702,015	\$20,510,127	185	\$3,808,112	22.8%	64.12%
29	7,540,048.00	4,895,630.48	5,606,273.69	710,643.21	1,156.08	14.5%	32,954,536	83.15%	\$21,597,646	\$26,116,401	219	\$4,518,755	20.9%	83.15%
30	1,855,270.00	1,251,387.11	1,392,148.66	140,761.55	413.25	11.2%	34,809,806	87.83%	\$22,849,033	\$27,508,550	225	\$4,659,517	20.4%	87.83%
31	1,402,883.00	923,985.83	990,925.74	66,939.91	252.83	7.2%	36,212,689	91.37%	\$23,773,019	\$28,499,476	226	\$4,726,457	19.9%	91.37%
32	426,006.00	282,235.61	301,806.17	19,570.56	81.33	6.9%	36,638,695	92.44%	\$24,055,255	\$28,801,282	222	\$4,746,027	19.7%	92.44%
33	2,455,030.00	1,779,064.26	1,875,132.50	96,068.24	1,038.67	5.4%	39,093,725	98.64%	\$25,834,319	\$30,676,414	246	\$4,842,095	18.7%	98.64%
34	41,537.00	25,723.95	26,503.65	779.70	7.00	3.0%	39,135,262	98.74%	\$25,860,043	\$30,702,918	239	\$4,842,875	18.7%	98.74%
35	94,650.00	61,704.55	63,480.29	1,775.74	25.00	2.9%								
36	404,216.00	253,841.20	258,837.88	4,996.68	39.17	2.0%								
Total	39,634,477	\$26,175,901.29	\$31,025,682.74	\$4,849,781.45	216	18.5%								

6.92% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid 50.7% more than NFG costs

16.7% of non-residential NGS customer usage has paid 37.6% more than NFG costs